

Miscell

P	OFFICE OF INDIAN AFFAIRS.	1880
1110	Rec'd SEP 10	

Lt R. H. Pratt
 X / Carlisle Pa.
 Sept. 8 - 88

Repts. Communication
 from Dr. J. S. Per
 due reply to charges
 of R. H. Pratt

~~File~~

J
 Leabman

a

J. S. Bender, M.D.

INDIAN SERVICE
Inches No.

1110

1000

Sept. 7. 1880

Reply to communication of
Sept. 4. 1880 of Mr. R. H.
Pratt 10th Cav in charge of
Indian Training School at
Carlisle Barracks and vindi-
cating his course of treatment
at that school.

Training School for Indian Girls
Carlisle Barracks

Sept. 8th 1880

Respectfully forwarded to the
Near Commissioner of Indian Affairs

R. H. Pratt

10th Cav
in charge

a

Carhile Purna

Sept. 7th 1880

1st Lieut. R. W. Peatt 10th Coy.

In Charge of Indian Training School
Carhile Barracks

Sir:

Your communication of the 4th Inst. came duly to hand. and I have the honor to reply - Your statement of our conversation I accept as correct - in most points concerning you myself however my own explanation and my objections to this matter which I deem do not fairly represent my case - With respect to almost all the cases that entered the Hospital either dying or having to be sent home. was putting it in very strong language, and needs to be qualified, to persons not familiar with the circumstances. I believe that only four died belonging to this school, and one from Compton - in Connaught after their arrival at home - All the others that were sent off could have been

relieved temporarily at least - but it was thought
 best for the interests of the school that they be sent
 home, as they would in all probability be sick
 with every returning spring, and they were sent to
 their tribes at your suggestion. I certainly was
 distressed at the loss of such promising boys, as I
 would have been at the death of any person
 entrusted to my care in matter what tribe or
 color - but not because I thought they had
 not been treated properly, ^{treated} or that any other course
 of treatment would have saved their lives - your
 statement in regard to my handling my
 resignation is correct - I did not say that three
 months from this I could continue at the
 barracks without regard to your wishes, but I
 did say that next year I believed I could do
 so (having in view Garfield's election) but enough
 of this I presume the Department will care but
 little what either of us think or can do next year
 I said then and repeat now that it was not
 intended as a threat - My remarks about the
 school in case of Hancock's election was far from
 political, as I am on the other side of the fence

fact was made entirely from remarks made by
 numerous citizens. their desire being to have the
 soldier back - far be it from me either in word or
 deed to do anything detrimental to the school
 for I am heartily in sympathy with it - I did say
 that I objected to having an unprofessional
 man sit in judgement on my treatment as I
 did not consider any one outside of the
 profession capable of judging whether the sick
 were curable or not - I will draw my statement
 about the salary - Regarding my treatment of
 your individual case - I said I would not be
 surprised if you were sick for two weeks, and if
 you were not - I cannot for the life of me see why
 it should be set up as a decided reason why
 I am incompetent I have known older men
 and men of world wide reputation make
 grave mistakes than this and yet enjoy
 unlimited confidence, the medicine I had given
 you had accomplished its work and the dose
 of oil simply did what the mercury would

have done assisted in carrying it off and hasten
 the final result - I will now state what I believe
 to be the cause of the mortality at the school
 In the first place the Indians were brought
 here from ~~from~~ ^a climate where the atmosphere is
 dry and they have little rain, to one where the
 weather is proverbially changeable and damp
 and which has been particularly so during
 their sojourn here - again they were not
 accustomed to work before they came here
 and it of course had a tendency to heat
 the blood, and as they don't hesitate to
 throw themselves on the damp ground under
 all circumstances, the vents and pores open
 to consumption incident to disease and only
 the strong survive, and again the march
 over the mountains to camp a distance of
 fifteen miles on an unusually hot summer
 day evidently was the start of the disease
 that caused the death of John Benville
 and hastened those of Beau Neal and
 Andrew. That Indians are some difficult
 to treat when white is the universal ^{of every physician} ~~heredity~~

who has ever had anything to do with them
 and I have heard too of your employes
 who have had extensive experience with
 Indians say that in their opinion "A very sick
 Indian was a dead one" you acknowledged to me
 that you had a similar experience with an
 allopathic physician in Florida. My reputation
 and position in Carlisle are established and my
 skill is not questioned. and I can scarcely think
 in my treatment of yourself and the Indians
 skill and judgment both forsook me. I would
 rather think that in the latter the weak funny
 and dispoat to disease have died and it
 is the old story of the survival of the fittest

Respectfully
 J. S. Bevier M.D.

P.S. I desire that this be forwarded to the
 Department