

INDIAN OFFICE.

FILES.

CAUTION!

Positively no papers to be added to or taken from this file, except by an employee of the Mails and Files Division.

By order of

E. B. MERITT,

Asst. Commissioner.

6-4944

25030, 1916.

CARLISLE

File No.

824

Education-
J F Jr.

MAR 25 1916
MAR 25 1916

MAR -4 1916

FILED BY C. P. F.

My dear Mr. Paul:

The receipt is acknowledged of your letter of February 19, 1916, wherein, referring to the fact that you graduated from Carlisle in 1903, you call attention to a paragraph in the January number of the "Red Man," printed at the Carlisle School, in an article entitled "Training Indian Girls for Efficient Home Makers," and submit certain comparisons between the course referred to and the outing system.

In response you are advised that I have read your letter with a great deal of interest and I am glad to be able to say that to a large extent I agree with you as to the benefits of the outing system.

Permit me, however, to point out the fact that you have evidently drawn the conclusion from the article that the outing system at Carlisle is to be abandoned and dependence placed upon a school course for the domestic training of the girls. I am glad to assure you that there is no intention of abolishing the outing system. This system will be followed at Carlisle exactly as it has been

INITIALING COPY - FOR FILE

in the past and all benefits available heretofore for pupils from this system will be available for outing pupils in the future.

The article in the "Red Man" refers directly to an effort on the part of Carlisle School to present a practical training in domestic science. It is felt that we must be sure that every girl who graduates from a school like Carlisle has training in the really practical things which will be of fundamental importance to her in her later life. Assignments to kitchen detail and the various classes of domestic work around the school unquestionably are valuable in teaching proper habits of labor and giving some general training in domestic matters, but all of this work is necessarily institutional in character and does not give the proper perspective for the housewife, as for example in the case of the preparation of pies from a recipe providing for one hundred pies. Cases have been cited in the past where girls who were classed as most excellent bread makers in some of the larger schools were not capable of making bread for themselves and their husbands.

Under the outing system, admitting fully its benefits,

which as I have before said will be available in the future, the school authorities must depend upon the "patron" for the character of the training given to the pupil. In other words, one girl may be sent to a "patron" who utilizes her services principally as a nurse; in another family the girl may be more of a companion or a reader; while in the third the girl may get training in cooking and domestic work of a very ordinary type, and in almost every case some supplementary instruction is necessary if the girl who graduates is to have a complete knowledge of the various things necessary for her to know in her future home.

To meet this, therefore, the training in domestic science referred to is given. It is proposed to make it essentially practical. The girl for the time that she takes the course is trained under the surroundings which will be met with in the homes of people in ordinary circumstances. She is taught to adapt her cooking to the needs of a small family. She is taught the proper way in which the home of such a small family should be managed and the innumerable little things which go to make up the perfect home-maker.

To the girl who has received proper and complete

training in these matters under the outing system the course at most would be a mere review and in such cases she could be excused from doing the work; but to the girls who has not received such training, or training of an inferior character, it would be invaluable. The cottage idea is merely a practical effort to be sure that the girls who leave Carlisle have been taught housekeeping effectively.

In the same manner it is hoped to arrange courses so that before a boy leaves Carlisle we will be sure that he is at least well grounded in the fundamentals.

I thank you very much for your letter and assure you that I shall be glad at any time to give consideration to the suggestions of one like yourself who has gone through any of our schools and later made good in the world.

Very truly yours,

3-EO-1

(Signed) Cato Sells

Commissioner.

Mr. William L. Paul,
Cashier, Fidelity & Deposit Co. of Md.,
601 Pittock Block,
Portland, Oregon.

EDWIN WARFIELD,
PRESIDENT.



COMPANY'S BUILDING.

Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland

CASUALTY INSURANCE SURETY BONDS.

HOME OFFICE BALTIMORE

PORTLAND BRANCH OFFICE

601 PITTOCK BLOCK
PORTLAND, OREGON

JOHN D. ALCOCK, JR.,
MANAGER
PHONE MAIN 3269

February 19, 1916



Hon. Cato Sells,
Commissioner of Indian Affairs,
Washington, D. C.

Dear Sir:

FILED BY C. P. F.

My attention has just been called to the following paragraph in the January number of the "Red Man," printed at Carlisle, Pennsylvania, entitled, "Training Indian Girls For Efficient Home Makers."

"Carlisle for the first time in its history has installed such a course. We have this year built a model home cottage in which the girls are being trained to cook over a cook stove, take care of kerosene lamps and to prepare three meals a day in the most wholesome and economical way, etc., etc."

Before proceeding any further I shall tell you who I am. I graduated at Carlisle in 1902, and graduated at Whitworth College, Tacoma, Washington, in 1909. During this time I have been absolutely independent and have gained all the experience that could be gained by any other independent citizen of this country. Naturally when I read the paragraph above quoted, it struck me with a good deal of surprise that a paper coming from Carlisle could be so ignorant of the past record of Carlisle as to say in public print that Carlisle "for the first time in its history has installed such a course in which girls get a real taste of home life." I am not in any way indignant over the misinformation which the writer of the paragraph has acquired, but I wish to write to you for the express purpose of letting you know what I think of this new system. I trust that you will take my expressions entire-



COMPANY'S BUILDING.

EDWIN WARFIELD,
PRESIDENT.

Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland

CASUALTY INSURANCE SURETY BONDS.

HOME OFFICE BALTIMORE

PORTLAND BRANCH OFFICE

601 PITTOCK BLOCK
PORTLAND, OREGON

JOHN D. ALCOCK, JR.,
MANAGER
PHONE MAIN 3269

CS-#2

ly in the way they are intended, i.e. helpful criticism and vital interest of an alumnus who has gained considerable experience and has and is exemplifying by actual life the principle which the government is trying to inculcate in the minds of their students.

Carlisle was founded as any old student will tell you upon the principle that the way to teach an Indian the white man's form of living is to separate him from all Indian environments, place him among white men and keep him there. The way to teach one thousand Norwegians the English language is not to build a few cottages and allow a half-dozen or more to live in these cottages and read and write the English language for a month at a time but rather to take these one thousand Norwegians, transplant them to an absolutely English or American environment and put them in a place where they must talk English. This illustration will serve my purpose to illustrate the two methods, one tried by many years of experience at Carlisle, wherein Carlisle became justly famous inasmuch as in her Outing System each student had the privilege of going to a distinctly typical American home whether farm house or otherwise and there learned by doing day in and day out all the duties which can be required of an American citizen. Under these circumstances they do not indulge in a solitary month of delightful experiment in learning how to cook over a cook stove, take care of a kerosene lamp and to prepare two meals a day, but they are required to do all of these things and many more things day after day, sometimes for months and years.

There is another advantage in this Outing System as practised at Carlisle and that is that during the time these students are in the homes of selected families they are permitted to go to grammar school or high school and there to acquire the elementary and secondary education in the most practical manner. I wish to emphasize this fact that education acquired under these circumstances is very much better for the student than to acquire it at Carlisle itself, for this reason, the competition among white boys and girls in educational matters is very much more keen than among students at Carlisle. During the time I was there, I have known many cases where students who have been attending high school "in the country" as we called it, had skipped several grades and passed many students



COMPANY'S BUILDING.

EDWIN WARFIELD,
PRESIDENT.

Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland

CASUALTY INSURANCE SURETY BONDS.

HOME OFFICE BALTIMORE

PORTLAND BRANCH OFFICE

601 PITTOCK BLOCK
PORTLAND, OREGON

JOHN D. ALCOCK, JR.,

MANAGER

PHONE MAIN 3269

CS-#3.

who were much farther advanced the year before.

I know from my own experience that the progress made by the average at Carlisle is a very low average and that I really did not learn what real study meant until I attended preparatory school and later entered college.

I know of no department of education whether in the literary or industrial department that is not very inferior to the same course of study offered by any typical American school. Take the department in which I was trained, printing, that department merely gets the boys acquainted with the most elementary features of that industry. When I left the school I was classified as an "efficient apprentice." Yet, upon the market of labor in which services are bought and sold at their true worth, I could not command a greater wage than five dollars a week. And under these conditions I found that six months experience in a printing office in competition with white men, and trained by the daily tasks and problems, is superior to three years at Carlisle. This was due to congestion and lack of teaching facilities *at Carlisle.*

This should be a perfect analogy by which you may test the plan now advocated of teaching girls by an experimental month in a little cottage under conditions that may or may not resemble real life and the practical method in which boys and girls were permitted to go to selected homes and there have applied the individual instruction.

You know perfectly well the problem of the big college and the disadvantages of the big class; you know too the advantages of small classes in the small cottage and the tutoring system; they cannot be compared because it is demonstrated time and again that small classes in which competition is keen is the most efficient manner of giving instruction. The instructor is nearer to his or her student.

There is one other fact that should be mentioned in which the old Outing System of Carlisle is superior to the new plan; it is this: During the time these students are in the various homes and away from Carlisle, they earn a small amount of money. This is a good thing. It gives to those who have none the amount necessary to



COMPANY'S BUILDING.

EDWIN WARFIELD,
PRESIDENT.

Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland

CASUALTY INSURANCE SURETY BONDS.

HOME OFFICE BALTIMORE

PORTLAND BRANCH OFFICE

601 PITTOCK BLOCK
PORTLAND, OREGON

JOHN D. ALCOCK, JR.,

MANAGER

PHONE MAIN 3269

CS-#4.

maintain a good appearance. It cultivates pride; it teaches them the value of an earned dollar; it gives individuality and cultivates a sensible pride. Under the cottage plan contemplated, this element is entirely lacking and thus by setting up such a plan, the department would take away from these girls the incentive whereby they acquire the highest ideals.

There is another reason why the two systems should be carefully compared, and that is the cost to the government. One thousand instructors for one thousand students under the old plan cost nothing; indeed, these instructors paid a small salary to their students. Under the new plan the government contemplates building a number of cottages which of course must be furnished and heated and additional teachers and instructors provided all of which costs money. Not only that but no matter how many cottages you might build, they will be too few to give the individual the efficient instruction given under the old system.

After thinking over very carefully the two methods of teaching, the cottage plan appears to me so very limited in its scope and so far inferior to the old plan that I am really skeptical as to the earnestness with which it is being advocated. But for fear that it is being given more weight than I can even guess, I wish to present the above sentiments to you so that you might have before you some facts gained by an alumnus who is consistently and persistently endeavoring to work out the principles acquired at Carlisle. It is from such experiences that you must learn whether the plan used is practical or not.

There are many other things that I could tell you wherein the various methods used at Carlisle could be improved, but at present this seems to be the most vital and dangerous one that has come to my attention during the fourteen years that I have been out on the firing line.

If there is any fuller information you might wish from me or if you



COMPANY'S BUILDING.

EDWIN WARFIELD,
PRESIDENT.

Fidelity and Deposit Company of Maryland

CASUALTY INSURANCE SURETY BONDS.

HOME OFFICE BALTIMORE

PORTLAND BRANCH OFFICE

601 PITTOCK BLOCK
PORTLAND, OREGON

JOHN D. ALCOCK, JR.,

MANAGER

PHONE MAIN 3269

CS-#5.

believe my position is ill-founded in logic, I wish you would write to me and I shall be glad to make plain any point that you may properly criticise or that may be vague. In the meantime believe me to be

Yours very truly,

William L. Paul

Cashier.

WLP/LFP