

The RED MAN

January, 1897.

Containing article on civil service in Indian service.

5197

OFFICE OF
Indian Affairs
Rec'd FEB 6

1897

47/191

Int. Department.

Feb. 5, 1897.

Returns copy of "The Red Man" containing article on civil service in Indian service.

File

File ✓

February 5, 1897.

Respectfully referred to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs.

D. R. Francis

E.

SPECIAL

5197

INDIAN OFFICE,
Incl. No.

1897

3128

INDIAN OFFICE,
Incl. No.

1897

DECEMBER, '96 AND
JANUARY, 1897
COMBINED.

The Red Man.

MID-WINTER
NUMBER.

HIS PRESENT AND FUTURE.

"GOD HELPS THEM WHO HELP THEMSELVES"

VOL. XIV.

INDIAN INDUSTRIAL SCHOOL, CARLISLE, PA., JANUARY, 1897.

NO. 2.

PUBLISHED MONTHLY, IN THE INTEREST OF
INDIAN EDUCATION AND CIVILIZATION.The Mechanical Work Done by
INDIAN BOYS.Terms: Fifty Cents a Year.
Five cents a single copy.Mailed irregularly, Twelve numbers
making a year's subscription.Address all business correspondence to
M. BURGESS,
CARLISLE, PA.Entered as second class matter in the Carlisle,
Pa., Post office.

Most schools on Indian reservations barricade the way of young Indians wishing to go out from the reservation and tribe into public and other schools and into the higher opportunities of civilized life. Such schools are, therefore, only an authoritative agency influence to compel the continuance of tribal autonomy.

Congress is to be impudently to buy a reservation for the Catawba Indians in South Carolina and drum them together under the care of an organized religious management. We trust that Congress will do no such thing. The best thing that can be done for the Catawbas remaining on their present reservation, is to get them off and into the activities of our American life, and allow them to develop their manhood by the sweat of their faces. The barren tract of land on which a portion of them at present are located, and the starvation allowance of industrial, moral and intellectual force doled out to them from Church and State, is the mischief of it all. No matter what the condition of the half or more who have gone from the reservation, it would be a crime to recall them under any pretence whatsoever.

An educated Indian, who is man enough to take care of himself and not depend upon the Government and whose name is well known throughout the United States, said to us recently:

"The Indian Rights Association has outlived its usefulness."

In our judgment and knowing its work through all the years, it never had any usefulness, and has only been a hindrance. It was founded on false principles, and has been so conducted throughout. It never removed an atom of dirt from a single Indian, nor did it ever take a single Indian by the hand and lead him from his dirt and vermin surroundings out into the clean atmosphere of civilization where he can divest himself of these inherited infirmities; nor has it tried in all its years to introduce any Indian to civilization and to induce him to locate and feel at home and to make himself useful to his fellow men in that civilization; nor does it in any of its work or plans tend to accomplish these things, but it rather hinders the accomplishment of them. The Indian Rights Association lives at all only as a self constituted but ignorant and irresponsible supervisor, and because of distrust, most of which is phantom and of its own manufacture.

If re-examination of what our Government commissions and officials do and report by a self constituted organization such as the Indian Rights Association is necessary in order to secure public confidence and honest government, be-

cause of the wholly disposition of Government officials, then it logically follows that the investigating members of that association must, above all else, be entirely immaculate in order that they, too, be not watched by an additional association organized to see that they investigate and report truly, and so on ad infinitum.

For our part we would a thousand times rather hang our hats on grand, honest, venerable Senator Dawes and his commission, who after months of patient investigation under the orders of the President of the United States and Congress, make a report, than to give one moment's consideration to any report upon the work of Senator Dawes and his commission by spies sent out from the Indian Rights Association. The pity of it all is that such a large number of otherwise discreet and sensible people can be so gullible as to furnish money to these re-investigating associations, annually many thousands of dollars, to maintain and perpetuate such boyish abuse. No new facts are elicited and the money so wasted does great harm in the destruction of confidence in the cause it falsely assumes to help. Immeasurable good would have resulted had these large sums been expended in educating and helping young Indians out into higher and better life during all these years and the whole Indian situation would have been so much higher and better today.

In our observation and experience, average Government officials, I really selected to do the work, are just as honest, and far more able to give facts and right views, than the Indian Rights self appointed management and its temporary agents; and the Government reports, which can be had for the asking, are much more thorough and reliable for those wanting such information than the unnecessary volumes put out as annual and special reports by the Indian Rights Associations.

We are in receipt from the Superintendent of Indian Schools of four copies of a paper printed in Philadelphia called "City and State," edited by Mr. Herbert Welsh. These papers came to us in separate Government penalty envelopes, in each of which were also official letters from Dr. W. N. Hallman, the Superintendent of Indian Schools, in regard to our matters. We have looked the papers over carefully to find why they should be sent to us thus from this, our superior officer. We find them full of allegations against the Philadelphia City and Pennsylvania State Government officials, and also against present and prospective U.S. Senators from the State of Pennsylvania. Mr. Herbert Welsh is perfectly sure he knows just who would and who would not make ideal officials, nor does he hesitate to name them and allege his reasons. But none of these things, nor anything we find in his papers, bring them within the law permitting their free circulation through the mail under Government frank. We commend to the various newspapers of the country this original and emphasizing method of increasing their circulation. Simply use your influence and get officials into the Government service, and then require them to enclose copies of your papers with all their official correspondence, and thus a very thin letter can be made to carry a very thick newspaper through the mails, free, your opinions being highly endorsed, and subscriptions increased.

At the last Mohonk Conference, Mr. Herbert Welsh got into the Conference platform a resolution providing that a

committee of the Conference should wait upon President-elect McKinley and urge the retention in office of Dr. W. N. Hallman, Superintendent of Indian Schools, of an equal number of Members of Congress, selected by the people to serve and responsible to the people for governing the Republic officially should wait upon Mr. McKinley for the same purpose, their act would be denounced at once by Mr. Herbert Welsh and the Mohonk Conference as a vicious, political "Spoils" proceeding.

PRESIDENT GRANT ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM.

A President is, for the time being, naturally in favor of civil service reform. Patronage is the bane of the Presidential office. A large share of the vexations and cares of the Executive come from patronage. He is necessarily a civil service reformer, because he wants peace of mind. Apart from this, I was anxious to have civil service reform broad enough to include all its most earnest friends desired. I gave it an honest and fair trial, though Geo. W. Curtis thinks I did not. One reason for his opinion may be that he does not know as much about the facts as I do. There is a good deal of cant about civil service reform, which throws doubt on the sincerity of the government. Its advocates give the impression that most executive appointments are made out of the penitentiary; of course no reform can be sound that is sustained only by wild declarations. Then many of those who talk civil service reform in public, are the most persistent seekers after offices for their friends.

THE UNCIVILITY OF THE SO-CALLED CIVIL SERVICE REFORM

Civil Service in the Indian School service, in March next, will have had five years to demonstrate its worth. During that time Civil Service in the Indian School service has been absolutely under the imperious control of two persons,—Gen. T. J. Morgan, late Commissioner of Indian Affairs, who inaugurated it, and Dr. W. N. Hallman, for more than three years past Superintendent of Indian Schools, who has elaborated and enforced it.

Gen. Morgan was a prominent officer of the Indian Rights Association and was specially selected by that Association for the place of Commissioner, and his appointment demanded of President Harrison by delegations of visiting members of the Association and by a flood of letters to the President from the other members of the Association. These letters were directed to be written by the head of the association. It is safe to say that not one in fifty of the members so visiting and so writing had a shadow of a conception of the duties and responsibilities of the Commissioner, or knew intimately Gen. Morgan or his qualifications.

Dr. Hallman, though not originally se-

lected by the Association, was submitted to the Association and fully approved by its head before his appointment was made.

Thus it will be seen that Civil Service in the Indian School service has had the fullest benefit of being demonstrated by its special champion—the Indian Rights Association. Civil Service for the Indian service has been a hobby of the Indian Rights Association for years. The principal reasons alleged by the Indian Rights Association in support of Civil Service were that appointments would be non-partisan; that worthy employees would have more permanent tenure; that a merit system of both appointment and promotion would prevail. After five years we can now safely say that it has at least been somewhat demonstrated whether or not the results in any material degree correspond with the promises.

As we have personally realized Civil Service to be a great hindrance amounting to almost a calamity to our work here at Carlisle, and have found it to be in no sense a help, and that none of its promises have been fulfilled, we have felt warranted in looking out over the whole field.

We now suggest to the Indian Rights Association that it take the official Indian Office Bulletin for 1892, which will give the names of the school employees at the close of the year in which Civil Service was made the sole experimental plaster, to cover and cure all our political decrepitude, imaginary and real, and then take the reports of the succeeding years and compare results with promises. We have every reason to believe that at the close of the fiscal year in June 1892, General Morgan, who was considered a thoroughly equipped school man, having been at the head of large normal schools and an instructor of teachers for many years, had fully worked out the ideals of his Association, and had supplied the Indian schools with just the force of employees the Civil Service demanded. A tabulation by name of the school employees in service at the close of the fiscal years of '92, '93, '94 and '95, shows that in 1892 there were, for instance, 103 Superintendents in the Indian school service; one year thereafter, at the end of June, 1893, only 60 of these remained. At the end of the fiscal year, 1894, 15 more had disappeared from service. At the end of the fiscal year, 1895, 13 others were missing, leaving only 32, less than one-third of the original 103 in service, 71 having been put out of service within three years.

The same table shows the total number of teachers in the Indian school service receiving salaries of \$600.00 and upward, at the end of the fiscal, 1892, was 368. At the end of the year, 1893, only 163 of these remained, 205, or more than one half, having disappeared. At the end of June, 1894, 31 of the 163 were out of service, and at the end of June, 1895, 16 more were missing, leaving only 116 of the original 368 still in service.

The maroons in the school service at the close of the fiscal year, 1892, receiving salaries of \$600.00 and more, numbered 83. At the end of June, 1893, only 35 of these remained in the service, 48, or more than one-half, having been displaced. At the end of June, 1894, only 24 remained; and at the end of June 1895, only 19 of the original 83 remained in service.

All the people in these three positions were all this time under the protection of this so-called Civil Service. These figures are commended to the many very ex-

cellent people, who are blindly led by the glittering assertions and well-turned eulogistic of Civil Service phrases of the head of the Indian Rights Association, and commended to their prayerful consideration.

But a greater showing of the want of protection and utter violation of the promises made by the Civil Service may be found by taking the Annual Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs for 1892, and his Annual Report for 1895, and endeavoring to find at the different schools at the close of the year, 1895, those who were at the same schools at the close of the year 1892, three years previous. We give a few examples:

(While we have not gone over the whole list we are satisfied that the showing would be about the same at the other schools except Carlisle, and perhaps Haskell).

In 1892 there were 61 employees named as having positions in the Indian School at Albuquerque, New Mexico; at the end of the year 1895, the list of employees for the same school shows that only 4 of the original number remained.

In 1892 there were 51 employees on the list as belonging to the Indian Training School at Chillico; at the end of 1895 only 4 of these remained.

In 1892 the names of 40 employees appear on the roll of the school at Genoa, Nebraska; at the end of 1895 not one of this number remained.

At the end of 1892 the rolls of the Chemawa Training School at Salem, Oregon, showed 42 employees belonging to that school that year; by the report of 1895 only 8 of those remained.

During this same period the frequent changes of the superintendents at the heads of these schools is also worthy of attention, as showing the utter falsity of the claim that Civil Service not only selects well but also protects.

Counting the Special Agents and Supervisors temporarily in charge during these three years, Genoa had different superintendents; Albuquerque had

seven. Indeed, the superintendency of the school at Chemawa, which is intended to be "the Carlisle of the Pacific Coast," changed hands 5 times within 12 months, counting the Supervisors and Special Agents temporarily in charge; and it would seem a sarcasm, that the one selected as the final and eighth superintendent inflicted upon that school since 1892, should be a native of Canada, as though, after many tests competent persons for the place could not be found among natives of the United States. By this showing, what a failure at selecting school employees and organizing schools General Morgan was!

Civil Service claims to make selections upon merit through a merit system. Our observation and experience is that real merit retires from the presence of the red tape delays and peculiar methods of the Civil Service system, and leaves an open field to those who are not wanted elsewhere, and that fact very often shows that they are not particularly meritorious. Business men everywhere, in selecting their employees, hunt carefully for those who are efficient, and expect to almost universally find such already employed, and, to secure them they offer more permanence and adequate inducements. Civil Service finds for the schools very few teachers and employees of proved ability. It is rather from the ranks of those who may make a good paper showing but from some infirmity of disposition or other disability are rejected by the business, school, and other industrial life of the country, that its candidates come.

After the five years' experience we can now safely say that it is only colossal stupidity and utter absence of common sense which can claim that a non-partisan service, impartial in selection and promotion, is to be secured through a Civil Service aided in a Republican administration by a Commission of 2 Republicans and 1 Democrat, and in a Democratic administration of 2 Democrats and 1 Republican. To have anticipated anything else in the beginning, only demonstrated our gullibility in accepting the assertions of

the so-called reformers. In a Democratic administration a Republican in any position is offensive, and vice versa.

There are some reasons that ought to be considered why this is so, and why possibly it ought to remain so. Different parties represent different policies; not only general policies, but minor policies, else there would be no parties. For instance, we will say that the Republican party had come to believe that the Indians should be absorbed and made a veritable part of the population of the country and that, in order to accomplish this absorption, they should be gradually worked out from their tribal life and, through special and public schools, and by association with the national life remote from the tribe, gain the necessary courage, ability and experience to fill their places. In the accomplishment of this purpose the Republican party placed Indian schools in the midst of civilization, and from them sent young Indians out into the public schools and into experience in civilized industrial life, and to carry out the scheme of absorption it filled the Indian service with employees who believed in its purposes and persistently labored to accomplish them. In the meantime the Democratic party came into power, and accepted the theory of some of its adherents, and wishing to have a policy all its own and not to adopt the Republican policy, it became reactionary and returned to the old reservation, tribal autonomy methods; and in order to make its policy a success it of necessity had to have those to do its work who believed in its policy. It was, therefore, perfectly consistent and proper that it should eliminate the Republican employees not in sympathy with its policy, and did so. Then after a trial, the people said they were not satisfied, and placed the Republicans again in power, thus giving their wishes not only on the larger questions, but on the Indian question, directing that the work of absorbing the Indians and of making them self-supporting among the people of the country shall be resumed.

Now in carrying out the expressed will of the people it seems to us equally necessary and proper that the Republicans should again have the aid of officials and employees who are in sympathy with the plans of the party, and not be forced to use those who were selected and put in place to carry out a reverse policy.

In making these changes from administration to administration, Civil Service Commissions probably are and probably can continue to be most useful.

The most hurtful feature of Civil Service, as we have experienced it, is its monarchical trend. Never in the history of the country has more absolute power of appointment and removal, selection and promotion been placed in the hands of one man than has been placed in the hands of the Superintendent of Indian Schools, especially since the last sweeping orders of the President.

Capt. Pratt, who inaugurated and built up the School at Carlisle, now has not the slightest voice in the selection of a single employee to help him carry out his purposes and to continue building up and forwarding the work entrusted to him by the Congress and people of the United States. Within a few days he has been informed by the Office of Indian Affairs that the Civil Service (i. e., the Superintendent of Indian Schools) will select and send to him such petty employees as one Assistant Seamstress and two Assistant Laundresses; these to replace employees selected by Capt. Pratt who have been months in the service of the school and who have been endorsed to the Indian Office as proving satisfactory, but who have not passed the curriculum of the Civil Service examinations. Experience shows that discontented, incompetent washerwomen from other schools may be transferred to Carlisle in order to quiet emulations of their creation in those schools, perhaps to become disturbing elements at Carlisle, or be forced out of the service (because the personal expense of transfer is not warranted by the salary) and so give chance for politically acceptable selections from the Civil Service lists of washerwomen.

To show that we speak advisedly in attributing vast power in transfers, selections and appointments to the Superintendent of Indian Schools, we give one of his own experiences as told to us by himself:

A matron was wanted at a certain school. He had just the person for the place, but she could not be appointed except through competitive examination. Accordingly it was advertised that examinations would be held at a certain place for a matron for that school. Fifteen persons took the examination. The person who passed at the head of the list was a Negro woman, and the person the Superintendent wanted was 76th on the list. The rules of the Civil Service require that the three names standing highest on the list shall be sent by the Civil Service Commission in each case for the Indian Office to select from. In order to get the person he wanted he astutely called for names for selection of three matrons, which brought nine names to his office, and among them the name of the person he wanted, when the formal selection of the person he had selected before was made accordingly.

It can easily be seen from what we have shown that the Superintendents of Indian Schools who are the men that must be depended on to do the actual work everywhere, are helplessly at the mercy of the one-man power in Washington. Suppose the general Superintendent of Indian Schools is inimical to the Carlisle School and its Superintendent, and does not feel just equal to the task of removing said Superintendent, how easy it is for him to worry that Superintendent into desperation by insidiously selecting or transferring to that school incompetent, disgruntled, spying, unworthy employees. Not only that, but how easy it is for the Superintendent of Schools to discredit the judgment of the Superintendent of Carlisle throughout the service by promoting and transferring to other schools such and other unworthy employees.

It is not surprising that the Superintendent has no courage enough left to try to protect his work and report against them.

It will be noted that in nothing we have said have we favored any recurrence to the system that would again flood the offices of the Departments, and even the White House, and burden Congressmen with applicants for petty places in the Government service. But to destroy one abuse, it should not be necessary to build and foster a greater. We cannot see why, on submitting stipulated and even most stringent proof of intelligence, worth and ability of all nominees, those who have the Government's work to do should not still have some influence in the selection of their assistants. From our "standpoint" this is good sense and good business, and we can't for the life of us see why it is not good government. Every good workman does better work and takes greater pride in it for having the use of tools of his own selection. The present Civil Service is more of a spoiling and "spoils" system than the system it succeeded. There is a difference only in method.

A MEMBER OF THE SOCIETY OF FRIENDS OBJECTS TO FOOTBALL.

The following kindly letter, well-meant, may speak the minds of others, hence it has been thought proper to give it a place in our columns, and also to print Capt. Pratt's answer:

QUAKERTOWN, N. J., Dec 4th, 1896.
TO R. H. PRATT.

ESTEEMED FRIEND:—Upon reading the papers some, I see so much that I do not think to be profitable for mankind to know, and especially the young in this life, and so much time unprofitably spent. As this life is short at the longest, it does not seem to me right for so much time to be wasted, for time once lost is lost for ever, time once gone will never return, time unprofitably spent is wasted. Now, there being a man having the care of the youth, I felt to call thy attention to the

many non essentials, and some of them I call evils, that are taught or allowed in many of the high schools of this day, which I would think much to their detriment, if it were my children thereat, such as football and baseball, and extremes of some other things as well, so much so I think the next generation will want to spend half their time in plays and amusements, or they cannot be satisfied, (for they were taught them at school), which if they cannot do will not be satisfied, so will lead unhappy lives; and who will be to blame for this? Let those who have the care think of these things. I see by the papers there are often football plays going on at most of the high schools of our land, (even at Friend's Schools) and at the Carlisle School, and play for strife with college students elsewhere. I did not know that these allowed such to be done by thy boys, but learned to my sorrow it was so, and encouraged by thee. I see that Kansas has passed a law prohibiting such plays in their State, showing as cause that four men have been killed the past year and 125 wounded. Now do we regard life or do we pay no regard to having so many men wounded, and for no good cause. Some of these may perhaps suffer all their lives, and some perhaps become a charge for other hard-working men to support; for overstraining and exertion may cause this. when if we would all live by the rule to be moderate in all things, even eating, and drinking and exercise, our lives would be prolonged, and would be a blessing to those around us. Now I do not expect to convert thee to my way of thinking, as our education has not been alike nor our surroundings, but we are all straining for the right, so let us see what would be right. I think it is written in that book we call sacred, that whatever we do should be to the honor and glory of men, and whatever we do for man, should be for his advancement and uplifting, instead of lowering or degrading him. I always felt to say that

to educate him and make him a citizen, but as our own nation is fast running out into these non-essentials, much to their detriment, why should thee try to keep pace with them in these things, by allowing the Indian boys to go the same way in these brutal games, that do them no good, either morally, intellectually, or physically, but I think to the contrary?

Now it is perhaps too much for me, a mere commonplace man, to write to one so far superior to myself about these things, but it will be a relief to my mind whether thee considers them or not.

Our boys that are out on farms when they see the accounts, are elated by them.

I do wish that these non-essentials could be discarded by the people generally, then would our nation advance and flourish, then would we arise and prosper, but, there is so much to draw them from the essential things, both temporally, and spiritually, that we lose sight of that which is really good, which says Love the Lord thy God with all thy might and strength, and thy neighbor as thyself for on this hangs the law, that we should follow with love to all mankind that strive to do right. I remain thy Friend,

ABRAM R. VAIL

Captain Pratt's Answer.
CARLISLE, PA., DEC. 10th, 1896.

ABRAM R. VAIL, QUAKERTOWN, N. J.
ESTEEMED FRIEND:—I have your letter of the 4th giving your views on what you are pleased to term "non-essentials" and "evils" in the high schools of today, referring to ball games, both foot and base.

I appreciate your frankness, thank you for the criticism, and have given full thought to your views. There are two sides of course. I note that you do not charge that Carlisle is different from your Friends' schools in these matters, and that you admit that such games are quite universal, that only Kansas legislates against them.

Yours is the second material criticism received, though I have had twenty-five or more letters, some from distinguished people, even distinguished "Friends," applauding the success of our Indian boys in their football games. If the favorable and unfavorable comments re-

ceived are to guide in forming a judgment the pressure in favor of allowing these games is all on one side. While there are some features in playing in some teams that ought to be done away with, I am compelled from experience and observation to generally favor both football and baseball.

You urge brutality and allege killing and wounding. The most serious hurt we have had was a broken leg, but one of our boys slid off a load of hay and broke his leg. Others have been seriously disabled by being kicked by horses and cows while out on farms attending to their regular farm duties. One of our boys, being driven home from church by a lady, was run over by the cars, the lady killed and the boy nearly so. Another returning from the country was run over by a train and killed. We cannot on this account consistently condemn hauling hay, milking cows, taking care of horses, going to church, etc. From experience and careful observation I feel safe in saying that the over straining and exertion you speak of are in proportion no greater nor less dangerous than that boys are subjected to while performing legitimate farm work. The harvest and hay field and other heavy work is quite as objectionable on that account. Our experience is that the straining of farm work, like the straining of football, develops men and makes them physically able to carry burdens and quick and accurate in determining what to do. When I was a boy, games fully as dangerous were indulged in, and as I have observed all through life there is apparently no diminution to this outlet for the extra energy of youth. The strains and dangers on the ball field, in skating, swimming, running, jumping, etc., etc., helped greatly in preparing me for what I have had to contend with as a man. Physical struggle, like mental struggle, needs to be intense and severe in order to reach the highest results.

You have been a patron of our outing system since June 1881. You have had young Indians under your care from the Apache, Sioux, Cheyenne, Crow and other tribes. Besides several others, I count six boys and girls whom you have had in your family, who came to us practically from the camp condition, some of them entirely camp Indians. Besides using them to help run your farm and household affairs you have sent them to school winters, and their services out of school hours have paid you for doing this. The great practical benefits these young people derive from your using them to carry on your farm and housework and from their daily association with you and your family and neighbors and in the public schools can never be estimated. We have had over three thousand like outings with scarcely an exception to the most beneficial results. This feature of our school has grown so that these young people earn for themselves about \$20,000 every summer, and the numbers placed out average about 500 each year. You have read my reports and know that I have detailed this valuable feature of our work to the Government year after year and have tried to get the Department to utilize this opening door for the Indians and to increase the number, and require other schools to pursue these methods. Most of these young people pass to and from such homes through the great city of Philadelphia, and yet this part of our work has not, in the whole seventeen years of our history, attracted the attention and comment that this Fall's football campaign has! Now it seems to me quite proper management and administration to let the football boys go on with their contest and attract attention to themselves, their race and the school by their prowess, in the hope that this will lead to a fuller consideration of the real, solid work of the school which you and so many others who know about it approve fully. If this Indian man, who has been condemned on all hands through all the centuries, as a lazy, worthless fellow, has not yet freed himself by such magnificent demonstrations as he has made here, of his power and willingness to work, through all the years of the school, by what he has

done on the farm, in the shop and in the household, it may be that in his successful, contentious on the football field, in the presence of so many thousands of critics and unbelievers, he may secure such appreciation of his conduct and abilities there as to lead the public and the Government to healthier thought and arrangements for him on these practical lines. There is another feature in it, personal to myself. I have considerable elation and reward in seeing my boys shake up and even overcome the trained college athletes with all their centuries of development and intelligence backing them. It confirms that after all "the contact of peoples is the best of all education." We are now and have been for some time under reactionary influences and principles in educating Indian youth. What is being done is calculated to relegate education to the tribe and to deny the privileges of contact, competitions and experiences in civilization. The educational system for the Indians is being so directed as to more and more close the doors out from the reservation and minimize the civilized and civilizing opportunities to Indian youth. Consequently there is the greater need for promoting and encouraging these special efforts which you condemn. The country has been dozed to the full with Buffalo Bill Show exhibitions, and public parades of Indian savagery are highly endorsed and facilitated. These low contacts of the Indian with intemperance, gambling, etc., need to have a strong counter influence, and Indians be led to aspire to exhibitions of their powers along the lines accepted as best for the development of our own race.

I am keeping my hand on the throttle, and watching carefully the on going of this train. So long as I believe as I do now, that it is doing good to the cause and will probably lead to deeper public thought as to what is best and right for the Indians, I shall accelerate it. If I discover that the contrary is likely to result I will stop it. In the meantime I think we had better have work a plenty, study a plenty, civilized experiences a plenty, and a plenty. As others among our hundreds of farm friends and helpers may think along your lines and want to know why, I think it best to print your letter and mine. Sincerely your friend,

R. H. PRATT.

FOOT-BALL.

Comments from Leading Papers.

Greatest Game of the West.

The Chicago Sentinel.]

Custer's last charge was given in the great Coliseum here to-night with graphic reality. White man met Indian and for more than two hours fierce battle was waged. The red man triumphed.

The Wisconsin players came to Chicago with little hope of successfully coping against the red men. They did as well as they expected, but they were overmatched. In the first half they more than held their own, but the Indians' better physical condition told in the end, and in the second half Wisconsin went to pieces, while the Indians, livened up to the play, went into the game with renewed efforts and carried everything before them. Into the Badger line they rushed for long and continued gains.

Taken all in all it was undoubtedly the greatest game the West had ever seen. The great Coliseum contained fully 13,000 people and every spectator was on keenest edge from the kick-off to the call of time. The first half was fiercely fought and neither side can make any very substantial claims to having done the better playing.

On the whole the game was cleanly played, no slugging being noticeable. The Indians made practically all of their advances by tandem center and tackle plays.

Slid Down Their Backs.

Chicago Times.]

The Indians scored three touchdowns and followed each of them with a clean goal.

The badgers put up a plucky game, and

it looked like a reasonably even match in the first half, but in the second half the Indians changed their tactics, and it soon became apparent that Wisconsin had little chance of winning. Carlisle began the steady, persistent hammering at the center that told so heavily on Yale, and the badgers were helpless. The Indians went through the opposing lines almost at will. They varied their play by bowling over the heads of the badgers and sliding down their backs like so many eels; now and then an Indian would squirm through the legs of the Wisconsin men, and every time they bucked or wriggled there was a gain.

No College to Compare.

By A. Fleming, of Chicago, in a private letter.]

I also wish to go on record as believing that no college in this or any other country could select from its sportsmen 49 men who would compare for one minute with the very gentlemanly qualities everywhere noticed in the conduct of your Indians, and every one here commended you. I am a firm believer in Carlisle and in the football team of the school.

First Class.

Harpers' Weekly.]

Although the Carlisle Indian team is next in classification to the '96 eleven, it had the individual material to have placed it higher on the list, had the school been longer familiar with the game. Individually and collectively the Indians were immensely strong in simple plays of football, but in tackling and in the general science of the game they were weak. B. Pierce, Cayou, and Metoxen are of the first class.

Does Not Apply.

Commercial Sun.]

"Lo! the poor Indian," does not apply to that Carlisle football team, as we in Chicago learned to our sorrow and regret. Its latest achievement is the defeating of the University of Wisconsin team, the champions of the West, by the score of 18 to 8. And football is a pastime of civilization.

An Apache Indian's Estimate Of The Occasion.

Chicago, Dec. 23, 1896.

CAPT. R. H. PRATT, CARLISLE, PENNA.

DEAR CAPTAIN:

I can give no words that will express the amount of good, the awakening power of what Carlisle is doing for the rising generation of the Indians by your football team and band coming to Chicago.

The football fought and won the laurel of the West; the band instilled into the hearts of the cultured and refined that delicate and most sacred character in the Indian.

University students from a distance have been entertained in Chicago, but they never equalled Carlisle students in their gentlemanliness. Football teams have won victories on the gridiron and boisterously manifested their glee, but Carlisle boys showed their breeding (Carlisle teaching), and were grand. Indian-like, they never uttered a murmur for themselves but praised the opposing team. I concur with them. Wisconsin team fought like spartans to the last.

Capt. Pierce was like a child, though possessing the strength of a giant; Dennison, like himself, good and ever the same though a thousand flattering voices vibrate in his ears; Mr. Thompson, judicious and ever mindful of his position; without the boys no victory nor would the gate be swung open from Chicago to Carlisle Indian Industrial School.

The Press Club, the pulse of Chicago, has had its eyes opened, and now they understand Carlisle as never before. The Chicago University and Northwestern University, the sinew of Chicago, were amazed, and the people of Chicago are all on the side of Carlisle. They thought at first the team was coming only for what money there was in it, but now they see different. It was only to make a way into

their hearts, so that they may realize their obligations to the Indian children for education and freedom into their enlightenment.

Captain, you have more friends in Chicago than you can shake hands with.

I shall not speak of myself. Mr. Thompson and Dennison will carry my message and my heart to all.

I wish you all "A Merry Christmas."

Sincerely,
CARLOS MONTEZUMA.

Views Of An Alaskan Indian.

LANE SEMINARY, CINCINNATI, OHIO, Dec. 23, 1896.

CAPT. R. H. PRATT,

CARLISLE, PA.

MY DEAR FRIEND:

I really enjoyed my stay with the boys in Chicago, and I was glad that I went. It is needless for me to say that the victories of the Carlisle boys over the Universities of Cincinnati and Wisconsin have drawn the attention for good of those who have been heretofore unfriendly to the Indian.

A very prominent man remarked to me not long ago here in the City:

"If the Indians can win in a football contest, I do not see any reason we should not give them a chance in the higher contests of life, as are found in science, politics, law, religion and education."

Yours very sincerely,
EDWARD MARSDEN.

An Eminent Football Authority.

A. A. Stagg, in "Men."]

Nothing could be stronger evidence of the value of training habits than this particular contest. The discipline of the Carlisle School requires the students to retire early and get a regular and full amount of sleep, and does not permit of smoking and drinking or other indulgences which would affect the physical condition of the men. Year in and year out this regimen is carried out. Plenty of physical work is added to their daily routine; no indulgences or irregularities are allowed, with the result that the boys have reached the

highest exposition of condition yet achieved by any football eleven that ever existed. If anyone ever doubted the value of training habits in getting strength and endurance he should simply have been present at this game and noted the magnificent physical condition of the Indian players. The game, in a nutshell, was won simply on condition. According to form and science the Wisconsin team should plainly have won. In only one particular were the Indians evidently their superiors, and that was in tackling.

Too much praise cannot be given the Indians for their splendid defensive playing. No team in the West can match them in point of tackling. I do not remember seeing a single Wisconsin player break away from his opponent when tackled, when once he had his hand on him, while again and again the tackling of a Wisconsin man was broken by the Indian runner. Another noteworthy feature which is new to western football was the fact that almost invariably the Yale injunction to "throw the runner towards his own goal," was obeyed. Time and again the tackler would carry his man back several feet. It did my eyes good to see it.

An Immense Impression.

Grand Rapids Democrat.]

If the heretofore "untutored Indian" shall prove the agency in transforming a brutal sport into a game of skill and gentlemanly deportment, the red man will have made an immense impression on the civilization of the world.

Wisconsin Could Not Overcome the Indians Rushline.

Chas. E. Patterson in Illustrated American.]

Notwithstanding the superiority of Captain Richards and the other men in her back field, Wisconsin could not overcome that powerful Indian rushline. The Carlisle forwards were equal, not only to stopping the Wisconsin backs from gaining ground much of the time, but also proved formidable engines of assault when their own men had the ball. While, at this

distance, it is impossible to say that the game was won absolutely on the effective merits of the two teams, the probabilities are that it was. At any rate, most people East and West, are ready to accept the verdict as rendered on Saturday evening.

Without desiring to detract from the merit of Brown's performance it is only fair to say that the impartial judgment of many men who are familiar with the work of both teams is that Brown, excellent as was the work of his players, could not have obtained a similar result at any other time in the season.

Exhibition Of Courage.

Chicago Chronicle.]

It was this splendid exhibition of stolid courage and endurance that won for the Indians the admiration of the crowd. Every gain of the warriors or its appreciation, and the shouting of the victors, got this "whoop in snawer":

Hollo—Holl-lee, who are we?
Hollo—Holl-lee, who are we?
Hollo—Holl-lee, who are we?
Indians from Carlisle see.

Those who looked for Indian stolidity, in fulfilment of victory or defeat, were disappointed.

They See The Town.

Chicago Times-Herald.]

They had no sooner reached the hotel than the corridor filled with curious people. This mob cornered each of the young men and then proceeded to see whether he could talk English, to find out the name of the chief of his tribe, and to ask all manner of questions about civilization as compared with life in the tepee. The door of the dining room was thronged by others who wondered whether the natives used forks or hunting knives. It was soon discovered that the good Indian is about as good as anybody else, and there has never been a more modest, less obtrusive and thoroughly quiet delegation of college men in the city.

Irresistible.

Buffalo, N. Y. Commercial.]

The verdict of the best judges is that if the strategy and higher tactics of the game could be added to the qualities of "rough football" in which the Indian team daily excels the combination would be irresistible.

Chicago Chronicle.]

Madison's men were brushed aside like stalks of Indian corn and the copper colored youths from Pennsylvania carried the oval down the field without the ball once changing hands. Only the welcome foot of the referee's whistle saved the badgers from a worse defeat.

The coliseum was one mass of shouting enthusiasts. Ten thousand people crowded around the arena and cheered the players on. Sympathy went to the Indians and the rooting of the Varsity supporters was drowned in the mighty din of "Carlisle! Carlisle!"

A Novel Game.

Chicago Inter-Ocean.]

It was the most bitterly contested football game seen in Chicago this season. The men fought everything in their utter recklessness. They played almost as teams never had played before. The Indians were the favorites and the victory a popular one.

It was certainly the most novel football game ever played in Chicago. It was an evening game, one of the contesting teams was composed of Indians, and it was witnessed by a crowd which numbered more than at the sport than ever congregated beside a gridiron.

Princeton Sophomores.

Minneapolis Tribune.]

The issue of "The Red Man" the organ of the Carlisle Industrial School, for November, is devoted to exolling the virtues and efficacy of the red man and brother on the football field. The Boston papers are quoted as saying that the Indians are from six to eight years behind their opponents in scientific knowledge of the game, but their game ranks ahead of that of a good many colleges in being transparently and unqualifiedly fair. The general verdict in Cambridge is said to be that the Carlisle youth are gentlemen and true sportsmen. Wouldn't it be a good idea to send the aborigines to Princeton to give the sophomores there lessons in civilization?

Indians Not Treated Like Horses.

Yonkers Statesman.]

At the very time in a man's life when he ought to be acquiring habits of self-reliance, self-help and simplicity of personal life, the young men on athletic teams are tended like race horses. The Indians from Carlisle were not, and it is one of the most agreeable incidents of their success.

Address of Honorable H. L. Dawes, Chairman of Dawes Commission Appointed To Negotiate With the Five Civilized Tribes.

At the last Mohonk Conference, President Chas. F. Merve, of Shaw University, read a report on the result of his investigation into the condition of affairs among the Five Civilized Tribes, made by him during the months of July and August, 1896, under the auspices of the Indian Rights Association. Following his report, Senator Dawes said:

MR. CHAIRMAN, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN:

The Dawes Commission, (as it goes by name in the Indian Territory) when it was announced to them that they were to be investigated, were glad enough to have those hands it was committed, for they felt that they would be safe in the hands of any one so intelligent, so faithful and so persistent in pursuing the right as Mr. Merve. I will say for myself that although investigation sooner or later overtakes most public men, it did not reach me till rather late in life, and I must confess that when the charge was made that I was lacking in respect to the rights of the Indian, I rather took it to heart. I shall devote myself for the little time I have, entirely to trying to relieve those people who were properly enough sensitive at the idea that something was going to be done by me and by those associated with me to violate the treaty rights with the Indians.

I think that a stranger studying the character of our country would hardly be surprised at anything so much as to be told that there was in this country under the common Constitution of the United States and under the same flag that floats over its capitol, still another people claiming under this very authority an independent power to govern and control itself without regard to the Government or laws of the United States. If he should seek further for the reason, for the authority under which such a claim of independence is based, he would be puzzled far more to find either reason or authority in the Constitution or in law for such a condition of things. He might wonder how it could be, how it were possible, that there could be carried on here any *imperium in imperio*; how there could be another nation within this nation, yet independent of it. He would want to know why it came about and by what authority it could be built up by, or under, or through the same Constitution. If he sought it in the fact that it was a small community that had grown up incidentally and of so small relative importance that it did not matter anything, he would be mistaken, for it has a domain of thirty-one thousand square miles, four times as large as the state of Massachusetts, and two thirds as large as this grand state of New York. Ten Rhode Islands and Delawares put together could be placed inside of it; and still there would be room.

If he should inquire whether it might not be because of the peculiar character of the people in this independent territory he would still be mistaken. Since I have been in public service I have voted upon the admission into the Union of thirteen or fourteen States made up exactly of such a community as this is. The two States of Dakota were one territory made up of whites and Indians in almost all respects like this. The State of Minnesota, the State of Wisconsin, the State of Utah, the State of Nevada, the State of Oregon, the State of Washington, all of these States were made up exactly of the same kind of community and people. So it was not for that reason.

Was it because there are but few of them? Well, of these thirteen or fourteen States there was not one that had as many inhabitants in it when it became a State after it had gone through the pupillage of the territory, as are now residents in the Indian Territory, a population from three hundred and sixty to three hundred and seventy thousand.

Can any one give a student of our institutions any answer why it is then, that of all the territory in the States we have in the Union, there has been left this one

neither a State nor a territory of the United States, with no State or Territorial government at all, inside of this union at the same time under this constitution and this flag?

There is no answer to this question in law or in the constitution, much less in the possibilities of continuance. It grows out of the belief of a large portion of the people of the United States that somehow and in some way they have bound themselves to let it be so, the belief that the United States has abdicated authority over this people. If it is really and rightly so it is to be respected and adhered to, so long as public safety will permit and no law er.

I respect those people who sent Mr. Merve to the Indian Territory. I respect the sentiment that became anxious and solicitous lest we should be at work violating the treaty rights of these people. But I for one am unable to come to the conclusion that we ever did, or if we ever did we had the power to abdicate our authority over any one foot of the territory governed by the constitution and the flag of this country. I am happy to be able to believe that I shall show you, from the books, that we never attempted to do that, and I want to say to you that if we had; it was beyond the power of this Government under the constitution to do it. The constitution is the measure of the power of every branch of this Government. The constitution says this and

only about the territory of the United States: "Congress shall have power to dispose of and make all needful rules and regulations respecting the territory and other property belonging to the United States."

Congress must make the rules; Congress must govern the territory. No other authority exists in the Government to govern or control any foot of the territory of the United States outside of the District of Columbia except what I have given you, which requires Congress to do one of two things, make all needful rules and regulations concerning it or else dispose of it,—one or the other. They did dispose of this territory. They granted the title to these lands, to these people, for a purpose, but the rules and regulations concerning it, the government of it, they not only never did sell to them but they never could have sold, if they had undertaken it. Mark you it is Congress that must do this. The Congress of the United States has never attempted to do this. Whatever was done was in a sort of treaty not made by Congress, made by the executive with these people as if they were a foreign nation, and there was not a jot of authority in the constitution for them to set up a government over a portion of the people of this country that shall be independent of the United States.

But they disposed of the title to the land, and for what purpose? They conveyed the title to these nations for the benefit of the nations. Was it that the nations could sell it and dispose of it and make money out of it? Did the nations take it as you and I take a conveyance of sale? Not at all. They put it in the hands of these nations as trustees for each and every one of the citizen Indians.

It is not worth while to go back of 1866 although the original arrangement was made seventy years ago, before this people had any idea that there could be such a thing as individual ownership by an Indian. That is why the title was put in the tribe or nation for the use of the Indian and not in the individual Indian.

Land in severally is a revelation of thirty years afterwards. They took

these people away out into this country which was then six or seven weeks distant from civilized life, to make an atonement for the wrongs inflicted upon these nations in the States from whence they took them. They said to them you may do as you please out here.

At the time of the civil war these Indians went to war with us and they broke up by this the relations which had existed before 1866. After the war, the United States and these so-called nations made new treaties and established new relations. Afterwards it came to be revealed that the way to advance civilization with Indians was not to isolate them but to put them on their own feet, to make individual citizens of them.

Every one of these treaties made since 1866 contemplates two things, first that they shall hold this land strictly for the use of each and every Indian, share and share alike, and secondly they provided that the old system should pass away. It was provided that whenever they chose they might take land in allotment and the United States would survey and allot the land for them at its own expense, and that whenever they chose they might establish territorial government and legislate upon subjects prescribed whose scope and limitation depended on the approval of the President, subject also to the Constitution and Laws of the United States. Provision was also made for United States Courts in the territory, post roads, post offices and United States mails, and railroads under United States laws—a perfect surrender of autonomy if it ever existed. Then they stipulated how the land should be held.

From a single treaty made with the Chickasaws and Choctaws who held their land jointly I read as follows: The same thing is more or less clearly expressed in all the treaties of 1865-6.

Revision of Indian Treaties.

[P 276 Lines 12278-12287, treaty of June 22, 1855 with Choctaws and Chickasaws.]

And pursuant to a Act of Congress approved May 28, 1830 the United States do hereby forever secure and guarantee the lands embraced within the said limits to the members of the Choctaws and Chickasaw tribes, their heirs and successors, to be held in common; so that each and every member of either tribe shall have an equal and undivided interest in the whole; Provided, however, no part thereof shall ever be sold without the consent of both tribes, and that said land shall revert to the United States if said Indians and their heirs become extinct or abandoned the same.

That is what the United States solemnly guaranteed they would do, and when they do that and restore to every one of these poor Indians his equal share in every foot of that land and in every one of those coal-mines and of those vast possessions, the end has come. Those who hold power there will unlose their grasp and have no further interest in opposing any proposition that will bring the tribes into harmony in their own relations and in their relation to the Government of the United States. That is what this Commission has been importuning the United States at one end and the Indians at the other, to do. That is what those who hold the power to gather the fruits of their iniquities, grasping them with greed, into their pockets, have resisted to this day. This Commission has asked for the violation of no treaty obligation however questionable might have been the power to enter by treaty into any such relation. They ask that these treaty stipulations may be enforced. They were charged from the beginning to say to these people: "We want none of your lands, our desire is that you shall do this yourselves." Every word that we uttered was taken down in shorthand and reported to the President of the United States. Of every communication we made to them a copy was sent to the Executive. In every one of them it has been made plain that we were there to present to them the reasons why this condition of things, so graphically reported by Mr. Merve, could not continue in the midst of these people and in the midst of this Government. It is our conviction that this condition grows worse and worse every hour that it continues. The courts all round there are

filled up with trials of men for murders committed in the Indian Territory. One judge who has been there ten or fifteen years has sentenced something like one hundred men to be hanged for crimes committed in that Territory. There is no description that can compare with the reality, and it was our duty to impress upon them that a change must come, and we showed them the way. We showed them how their fathers in 1866 contemplated the having of this land in allotment. We have not troubled ourselves about the territorial government or about their becoming a State in the Union. We knew full well that the moment they took their land in allotment and each one had his own possessions and came to know the value of his own home, all the rest would follow; he would be for having a government, law, and protection, and he would become a part of the United States and of the citizenship of the States like all the rest. That was our duty and we have adhered to it.

I am glad to say to you that the light is breaking in upon them. The Congress of the United States imposed new duties upon this Commission last winter, after being convinced that we had not violated any of the treaty rights of the Indians and that we were not departing from the path of justice. They imposed on us the duty of settling forever this question of citizenship, and there are now pending before the Commission, that are to be decided by the tenth of December, the final judgments of the Commission upon 7,300 cases of claimants for citizenship in that territory. They see that the end is coming. The men who have the grasp there begin to see that they cannot tell where they will be when the end comes, and they propose to try the experiment of negotiating with us now. At this moment the Choctaw nation, which a year ago came within one vote of passing a law making it treason to negotiate with us, has this fall at its election chosen a chief in favor of negotiation. The Creek nation which has upon its statute-book, a law making it a penalty of death to petition the United States for a change of their government, have appointed a Commission, at the head of which is General Porter whom all the men who have had anything to do with Indians know. Even the Cherokees, bound up more than any of them in the grasp of these men who have taken everything that is valuable, have appointed a Commission to confer with us, and stalwart Bushy H. ad who was relegated to private life from the Chieftainship some five years ago because he was in favor of allotment, was the man appointed at its head. It has been impressed upon them that the Congress of the United States is going to take this matter in hand if they do not choose to do it themselves.

But suppose they have an independent government now, who made it? The Government of the United States made it, and if the Government of the United States made it, it can unmake it. While the property conveyed to these people is a vested right that can never be taken from them, the political status is not a vested right. There is no political condition that is a vested right in this country. It is constantly being changed by the power that made it, and the power that made whatever independent authority there is there, was the United States; and the United States has the power to resume it.

Now there is another way out of this. These nations hold their title as I have read to you, in trust for the use of the people. What have they done? They have misappropriated the trust. They have taken that use from the whole people and have put it in the hands of a few for their own private use, and what is plainer, in a court of equity than that when a trustee violates a trust he may be removed?

There are many ways out of this, not only to absolve ourselves from attempting to violate treaty obligations, but to take to ourselves some credit for enforcing the right. It is in behalf of the poor Indian, despoiled of his heritage, not of the white man, that we were sent down there; and it is in behalf of the Indian that we plead to have his possessions allotted to him

either by his own act, or by the Government of the United States, or by some court in equity.

I ask this Conference, at whose hands those at work for the Indians have received so much support in times past, to understand that you have approached now what seems to me the most important of all the questions that confront you. Here is this vast territory belonging to fifty-four thousand Indians, less than one-fourth of whom have any participation in it. All the others are driven off. I appeal to you in their behalf. Set them in the possession of their rights and then the remedy will be worked out after that. Give them, each one of them, what belongs to him, and he will see to it that what is necessary under the laws of the United States he will have.

DISCUSSION.

DR. LEMUEL MOSS: If I understand it, the United States in conveying this land no more alienated, its authority to legislate there, than when conveying a quarter-section to any individual.

MR. DAWES: Precisely. I do not suppose the conveying of the land conveyed the right of government. It is a distinct, separate right. The soil I may own, but I have no right to govern myself because I own the soil. The Indians claim that in addition to the conveyance of the land, the power of government was abdicated to them by the United States.

PRESIDENT GATES: Our whole treaty system has regarded the Indian as a foreign power. That is a humbug which is giving way gradually.

MR. DAWES: It has been forbidden by statutes and is no longer possible.

GENERAL EATON: It is in the interest of these three hundred thousand people who are preying upon the Indians in the Indian Territory to send out these documents assailing the Commission. They emphasize the idea that the Commission proposes to break faith with the Indians.

"We are the law-keeping people," they say. But we have seen here this morning that the proposition of the Government, of the President, of Congress, and of this Commission, is to keep faith with the Indians. It is a movement in favor of the sacredness of treaties and the sacredness of human character and of those great rights and privileges for which this Government exists. My thanks are tendered to these gentlemen and to Senator Dawes especially, for showing us this. There has been an attempt made to have the country believe that they were trying to get rid of treaties. No, no, it is an attempt to execute treaties, and I feel deeply grateful for having it shown that these gentlemen aim to keep the treaties solemnly made with these people.

DR. DENNIS WORTMAN: Senator Dawes says the National government has made each Indian nation trustee for the individuals of that nation. When the present government methods in the territory are overthrown will the present proprietors of mines and those who hold property there be dispossessed? Will all the land be divided among the Indians? If so what becomes of the proprietors of industries located on these lands? Will the retirement of the National trustee affect the rights conferred by the trustee before his retirement?

SENATOR DAWES: The whole matter is full of difficulties and perplexities. Take the mineral interests. There are millions of dollars honestly and fairly invested in the coal-mines by outsiders. A law was made that any citizen Indian who would discover a deposit of coal should have the exclusive use of a mile all around it with power to lease it. So they went to Pennsylvania where there are experts in coal mining and got these experts and they went out and told these Indians where to discover coal, and they discovered it and leased the land to capitalists. The Indian never could mine coal alone. It requires hundreds of thousands of capital and this capital has come from Pennsylvania and elsewhere and been invested honestly in these mines.

It would be rank injustice to destroy all that property. It has got to be the work

of negotiation and equitable disposition. The lands belong to all the Indians, not to the half-dozen who have discovered where the coal mines are. The same is true of the town sites. Large towns of 5,000, 3,000, 2,000 inhabitants have been built by the whites on the land of the Indians and vast sums of money spent upon them. I cannot tell you just how it shall be adjudged. I only say to you what I have said to these men: "We will sit down with you and we will try to work out a solution of this question that shall be not only just to you Indians but just to those men whom you have invited here and who have invested their capital in your work." All the southwestern country depends on those mines. Millions of property are involved in the question. How it shall be settled I wish I knew. The Commission is trying to make secure every man's rights in that territory.

CAPTAIN PRATT: If those who have charge of it will provide me with the matter and will send me lists of names I will publish Senator Dawes' address on this subject and distribute it without any expense to this Conference.

MR. MESERVE: In my full report I go into the solution of this problem according to my ideas and append a copy of the Curtis Bill introduced by Mr. Curtis, which passed the House and was before the Senate when Congress adjourned.

PRESIDENT GATES: A Government that brought so many States through the period of reconstruction can safely be trusted to work its way through this difficulty.

DR. FISHER, Pittsburg: We can let our sympathy go to the innocent white men who have gone to the Indian Territory. That is part of the problem. It may be very difficult but I think that side of the question might be emphasized. While Bishop Whipple is undoubtedly correct I believe the whole question rests upon the argument which Senator Dawes has made, that there has been no disposal of the power of the United States over that Territory. It rests with the Constitution. It is not because they have engaged in civil war. It should be kept before the people that we are not breaking treaty rights but enforcing them. The power of this Government over every portion of this Territory was settled by the civil war. It was settled for the Indian. It was settled for the South. We must keep that before the country. But in regard to this great question which incidentally arises in the minds of men, we must keep also this thought, that there are innocent men who have developed this property, and while the real estate may be of benefit to the Indian, we must consider it in the way of what it would have been to him if it had not been developed. I do hope this Commission will go on and that there will be no allotment of land and that we shall get rid of this state of affairs.

MR. GARRETT: While contentious are going on I wish to say that I was one of those who was very desirous for light on this subject as to whether any treaty had been violated. I feel deeply grateful to Senator Dawes for his very able and powerful exposition of the subject this morning. He has shown that under the Constitution of the United States the treaty-making power had no authority to surrender the sovereignty of the United States, and that occurrences since have completely authorized and legitimized the action which is now proposed. I feel quite satisfied with his statement of the case. Not only so, but the fact that the five civilized tribes having entered into the confederacy since during the war, placed us in new relations to them so that our old treaties were set aside, but the trust has been so violated that there are now separate grounds for the proposed action. I repeat I feel grateful to Senator Dawes.

REV. DR. STIMSON: The Government of the United States is itself a trustee. In all its legislation back of the specific act lies the recognition of the sacred trust that it shall always do that which shall tend to the permanence and safety of the nation and it shall only do that which is in the interest of public morals. These two primary conditions underlie every act of this Government and they are indis-

putable. As a result of the action of this Government in the past, there has arisen a condition which is only a concentrated condition of that which has existed in all Indian tribes described by the word IMPOSSIBLE. Three times in our history we have found ourselves in that condition. Once in regard to slavery, then in regard to the Mormons, and now in regard to the Indians. We hesitated in regard to slavery. Men were deterred by fear of violating a constitutional right, and ignoring those conditions which lie back of all law, those which grow out of the condition of safety and public morals. At last we were compelled to break through all the meshes of intricate legislation in order to create a system of government, a condition of government, under which the nation could live, and we did it. Practically we have done the same thing in regard to Mormonism, and that is exactly the condition in regard to the Indian Territory. I lived for some years not far from the Indian Territory. A friend of mine who was there said, that again and again he had been compelled to spread his arm over his wife and child and hold them in bed lest if they sat up they should be struck by the shots fired from the street by drunken men who wanted to drive them out because they respected religion and education. Such a condition of things is impossible. Any man who lived in the West when the Cherokee strip and Oklahoma were opened, must recognize that no matter what were the treaties, any legislation which would put free people under conditions in which such scenes could occur, must be wrong.

When these conditions assert themselves no matter what the word spoken is, no matter what the act of the Executive has been, it becomes the duty as well as the right of a Christian nation to wipe out impossible conditions and to create conditions which make possible civilization, the safety of the Government and the maintenance of public morality. Because of this I believe the time has long since come when the friends of the Indian ought to ask not for rights and privileges, but for a firm foundation that every right and duty be required of him as a man. When we do that we are on a firm foundation.

LET THE INDIAN HELP HIMSELF WHEN HE CAN.

When the Indian can help himself why not let him do it. The Santee Sioux think they have a claim of a million and a quarter of dollars against the Government. By their own representatives they have brought their claim into tangible form and recognized existence before the Senate of the United States and the Department of the Interior at Washington. But now that there is some show for success, in rush other parties, led by a former Indian agent, who say, "Hold on now; you have gone far enough; now give us the job of securing this claim and ten per cent for our share." This the Indians are reluctant to do. They think that it need not cost them more than a few thousand dollars for looking after their claim themselves, and that there is no need to make a freight of one hundred and twenty thousand dollars to this synchrate. It is not likely that they will be allowed to speak for themselves. Representatives of the Government are using to its official influence to discourage the independent effort of the Indians, and to give this plum to the syndicate.—[Word carrier.]

WHERE FROM?

President Dreher, of Rusk College, witnessed the Harvard-Carlisle football game at Cambridge. He heard a lady present ask a gentleman: "Where are the Indians from?" The gentleman replied: "They are from different tribes from the Carlisle reservation." So!

ENCOURAGING.

Boston Post.] It is getting to be a settled fact that the Indians are not a fading race, that they have not been gradually extinguished by civilization. And to this may be added the expectation that under the influence of education and better manner of living the vitality of the race will be increased beyond that which it had even in its most fortunate native conditions.

DISCUSSED BY INDIANS.

RESOLVED: That the Reservation system fails to make useful, independent citizens of Indians.

FIRST ANNUAL STANDARD-INVINCIBLE DEBATE.

On New Year's night, the Annual Inter-Society Debate was held in Assembly Hall, Judge E. W. Biddle, of Carlisle, presiding. There were a number of Carlisle's representative people present, and at seven o'clock the band rendered the opening selection.

Clark Smith, as president pro tem, taking the chair, said in part:

"We are at the foot of the ladder of knowledge and are trying to get from the foot to the very top. This is one of the main ideas of each Society. Now the hour for debate having arrived I have the honor of introducing Honorable E. W. Biddle who will be the presiding officer for the evening."

Judges appointed for the occasion were Honorable R. M. Henderson, a distinguished ex-Judge of the Carlisle bar, Rev. Alexander McMillan, of St. John's Episcopal Church and Rev. A. N. Hagerty, of the First Presbyterian Church of Carlisle.

Messrs. Robt. DePoe, Ed. Peterson, and Francis O. Jones, representing the Standard Literary Society appeared on the platform amid much applause, and took their respective positions to the left of the presiding officer, facing the audience.

Messrs. Frank Cajune, Brigman Cornelius and Alexander Upshaw representing the Invincible Literary Society, did likewise, taking their respective positions to the right of the presiding officer, and facing the audience. And again there was much applause.

MR. CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN:

I have been called upon to preside over what will doubtless be a most interesting occasion. I was astonished, however, in looking at the programme, to see that I was set down for a preliminary address. It is one of the fundamental maxims of a Judge, when any question is to be debated, or argued in his presence, to keep silent until everyone has spoken. So that it would not be fitting for me to in any way postpone this debate which so many people have assembled to hear, and to witness the efforts of these young gentlemen in the line of debate upon a subject which they, themselves, have selected. The question which has been selected for debate is: Resolved, that the Reservation system fails to make useful, independent citizens of Indians.

The following order of debate has been agreed upon: The first speaker on the list of affirmatives, will open the debate, and no speaker will be permitted to continue longer than eight minutes. The second speech will be made by the first speaker on the list of negatives, to be followed by number two on the list of affirmatives; he to be followed by number two on the list of negative speakers, followed by number three on the affirmative list, and by number three on the negative list; each of these speeches to be limited to eight minutes. Then number one on the negative list will be permitted to speak for four minutes, to close the debate on the negative side, and the first speaker on the affirmative list to speak for four minutes, in order to close the debate on the affirmative side. In that way those who commence the first part of the issue will be permitted to open and close the debate; the three speakers on each side to be limited to eight minutes and the closing speakers on each side to four minutes."

ROBERT DEPOE, representing the Standard and affirmative side, said:

MR. CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN: In this great wide world of ours, experience has taught

us that whatever is worth doing at all is worth doing well, and to-night, Honorable Judges, we propose to prove clearly and distinctly, regardless of the negative, that the reservation system has failed to make useful and independent citizens of Indians.

Every true American knows what a citizen is, and when we argue to-night, it is well that we make a distinction between a citizen and a useful and independent citizen. Any man may become a citizen of these United States, but yet not a useful and independent citizen.

Now then, Honorable Judges, allow me to show you a picture of what a useful, independent citizen of the United States is. There stands a king, a high and mighty governor, who says, "I rule all," then you see standing there a missionary, who says, "I pray for all." There you see standing a soldier, and with his mighty strength, he says, "I fight for all," and now comes the last, our humble farmer, and he draws forth his purse, and says, "I pay for all."

That is the man that clothes himself and the country from the crops of his farm; he is not only a king but a thousand times greater, and I honor that man. That is the man that pays all the expenses of the world, and is not dependent upon his fellow men. That is the man that is not dependent upon any organization or society, or upon any Government, or upon the United States Government for support, but means of self-subsistence.

And there, Honorable Judges, is your useful, independent citizen of these United States. There he stands to-day, sharing equally with his fellow men all the privileges of America citizenship, and there he will stand in the future, taking part in all matters of legislation and administration for the good of himself, for the good of his home, for the good of his fellow men, and for the good of his country.

Now then, Honorable Judges, that is the man we are to discuss to-night, and that is the man the negative side must prove the reservation system is making of the Indians. If not, then the reservations fail, or the negative fail to prove it.

In the past there has been more or less confusion in the public mind as to what the Government aims to accomplish. Persons who make an examination of this cannot help but come to the conclusion that it is not the object of our good Government to exclude the Indians, but to educate and to cultivate them, thereby making citizens of them, American citizens of them, who will be useful and independent citizens, as part of this nation; the Government proposes to make men of them, men who will go out into the world, and be men, not only in this country, but in the wide world, and stand firm and strong.

In trying to accomplish this object, the Government, in the past, has used two systems, and only one system needs arguing to-night, and that is the reservation system.

I have pictured to you what a useful and independent citizen of these United States is, and we will proceed to debate, in any country, or under any government, to become a useful and independent citizen, the first step towards independence, is to learn the lesson of self-support.

Now then, Honorable Judges, what is the Government doing today? Why, instead of letting the Indian go out for himself and earn his honest living, it has taken all the Indians, and put them upon reservations; and history has proven that this is the direct road to destruction and

ruin. What is the Government doing with the Indian under this reservation system? Buying those Indians clothing and feeding them, and what is the result of this? Instead of prosperity, idleness is promoted, and instead of useful, independent Indians, they are turned into paupers and gamblers, for the very reason that they have never learned the lesson of self-support.

Wherever there is a Government, there are also laws that exist. Now, if an Indian is made a citizen in a short time, it is just like this: We have the Indians there with their Special Agent, on the reservation; they don't know what he is there for; they realize the fact that the Special Agent comes there and allots his land. Tonight he may go to bed an Indian; he may be living in a house, hut or wigwam; tomorrow, he gets up a United States citizen. Now, how can you expect a man to be useful and independent, when he has not even been trained to know the laws of this country that he has to abide under? Do you expect a man to dream out the laws of his country in one night, Do you expect a man to receive his education in one night? Now, Honorable Judges, that is how the reservation system makes citizens of Indians.

In order to become an intelligent citizen, in order to know what to do, the Indian must have an education. Many of the Indians have no education; they are on reservations, and the Government is feeding and clothing them, without giving them an education. Do you expect such men to become useful citizens of these United States? That is just what the reservation system is doing with the Indians, and since they have failed to come up to the standard of other intelligent citizens, the reservation system fails to make useful citizens of these Indians. In reading the history of the world, you will find that in order for a man to —

(Time being called, the speaker retired, amid much applause.)

FRANK CAJUNE, representing the Invincible and negative side, opened the debate for that side, and said:

MR. CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN: The reservation system under debate this evening, is properly defined to be the plan of the Government in educating and clothing the Indians. The system embraces, first, the Government or laws to protect the Indians from unjust treatment by any persons or citizens; Second, where under the guidance of special officers and instructors, the Indian is taught self-support and independence; Third, a school system is placed among them to educate and civilize the younger generation. It also embraces the issuance of rations, when necessary, to the Indians upon reservations.

For a moment, what is this ration system?

My honorable opponents referred to rations. It is only a matter of form, and I will ask any person in this house, who knows, if there is a man that can live upon the rations that the Indians get? It is estimated at seven dollars a year per capita, and who can live on seven dollars? That is what they get from the Government.

And now to the question for debate, which is, "That the Reservation system fails to make useful, independent citizens of Indians." There is no limit to the question. It does not say that it will make citizens in ten years, or twenty years, or one hundred years, but we do say that it does not fail to make useful and independent citizens. It does not necessarily limit us to the United States; there are other reservation systems outside of the United States.

Another thing, the question does not confine us to any definite period of time, and if we can prove that the reservation system has advanced and progressed in any year, and my honorable opponents cannot prove that they have not progressed during that particular year, we claim the decision of the Judges.

We will make no attempt to prove that the reservation system is the only system, nor that it is the best system. We simply

claim that it does not fail in time; that it produces in time useful and independent citizens, and I can refer to scores of examples. All we will attempt to prove is that the reservation system is not a total failure; that it produces citizens; useful and independent citizens.

Then it must be understood that the reservation system and Congress are two distinct things; the reservation system cannot force Congress to act upon and make citizens of the Indians, after it has prepared the Indians to become citizens. The plan of the reservation system is to prepare its members for citizenship, and it is the duty of Congress to admit them into citizenship. The reservation system cannot compel Congress to act. The Dawes Bill says that whosoever shall abandon his tribal relations, that is to say, leave everything he has on the reservation, and go out into the world, and take up a claim, that he can become in time a citizen of the United States.

Now, Ladies and Gentlemen and Honorable Judges, there are thousands of Indians on the reservations who have one hundred and two hundred acres of land under cultivation, and who are supported upon the reservation. Who would leave all these improvements on the reservations all that he has; all that he has made at cultivation; who would leave that, and go out of the boundaries of the reservation, and make a new start, for the sake of becoming a citizen? At the same time he is useful; he is helping his people and making his own living?

There are thousands of people living upon reservations that draw not a cent from the Government; get nothing from the Government, only the land which of course was allotted to them. They make their own living upon that land, and that is all they ask from the Government. There are thousands of men who are self supporting; men that have been educated upon reservations, and it shall be shown by statistics that the race is progressing, and it shall be shown that men that have been brought up in reservation schools have gone out into the world and made their mark; stayed on reservations until they were men, and went out into the world and made their mark. (Applause.)

EDWARD PETERSON, representing the Standard and affirmative side, said:

MR. CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN:

The speaker spoke about the Government educating and clothing the Indians, and he said they were allowed seven dollars for rations for one year. The current expenses shown by the last report, and if it was a few hours earlier, I could say last year's report, \$8,716,712.24 were appropriated for the current expenses of 1896 in supporting these Indians on the reservations. (Applause.) He referred to the property as belonging to the Indians; where do they get them? Is not that money which they get from the Government used in making those improvements? Does not the Government make appropriations yearly to supply these Indians with these improvements? Tonight we are speaking only of those Indians that are prepared by the reservation system. These Indian citizens who are brought up on reservations, cannot possibly be useful and independent, because they do not receive the education necessary to qualify them for such a standing in life. In every instance where an Indian, the product of the reservation, has become a citizen of the United States, they have been so in name only, and not in reality, and from the very beginning of their career, they have been dependent upon the Government for agricultural implements, seeds, and other necessary things.

Now, Honorable Judges, why are they in such a condition? Because these reservations have failed to give them and teach them the duties of independent citizens. These reservations are Uncle Sam's zoological gardens, (Laughter), and are nothing more than hot-beds of idleness, ignorance and superstition, where Indians are cared for and kept by this generous Gov-

ernment, which thus fosters idleness and dependence. How can they become useful and independent citizens?

The Indian who becomes a citizen, must help to bear these expenses of the community by taxes, and it follows that if he doesn't bear the expenses, some others must bear them. The county roads and schools must be maintained, and in order to maintain them, some one must pay the taxes to defray the expenses thereof. Now the Indians, the most of these Indians, are exempt from taxes for a long period to come, and it follows that they are dependent on the white citizens of the State, or of the United States, where they reside, for the payment of the taxes to defray the expenses of these necessary institutions. Therefore, it follows, they are dependent and not independent citizens. Idleness, ignorance and superstition of reservation life, are not conditions favorable to the growth of the ideas of citizenship, and these cannot by law be transferred into intelligent, useful and independent citizens. The Indians who have not these necessary qualities, cannot become independent citizens, and Honorable Judges, tonight you can make up your minds, why they have not these necessary qualities. It is because these reservations have failed to give them these necessary qualities. It is generally the case that Indians who have thrust upon them the obligations of citizenship, are ignorant of the laws of the State or Territory they are brought up in, and must of necessity be placed under the care of an Agent, to keep them from being imposed upon by their more educated white neighbors. This ignorance of laws, and the condition of the Indians, is due to the failure of the system under which they had previously been trained and educated. The duties of citizenship are of such a nature, that they cannot be acquired, only through experience and custom. The Indians, previous to their becoming citizens, are isolated in the zoological gardens before mentioned, or more properly speaking, reservations, and have no example to go by, except the citizens who settle in the reservation.

Honorable Judges, as I am unable to go by, they of course do not attend properly and you can see for yourselves that this reservation system has failed to make these Indians useful and independent citizens (Applause)

BRIGMAN CORNELIUS, representing the Invincible and negative side, said:

Mr. CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN: The schools on the reservations are derived from two distinct organizations; one from the Government, and the other from various religious denominations, and they have done and are doing good work in preparing the Indians in education and Christianity. If the schools on the reservations were not progressing, they could not have turned out such great men as they have in the past—educated men on the reservations, who have proved useful and independent, and would be citizens, as they were qualified to become, if Congress admitted the Indians as such. The reservation schools are doing more important work than the non-reservation schools. They are preparing the Indian youth, and when these young Indians reach certain grades in their education, they are taken to the non-reservation schools. The same work could be accomplished in the reservation schools that is now being accomplished in the non-reservation schools, if the reservation schools only had the chance to do it. The Friends' Society who were working in Nebraska, reported in 1872 that their work in the schools was very encouraging. This shows that the progress in these schools must have been great, although it existed only three years.

In 1883 thirteen schools were established among the civilized tribes of the Indian Territory, and those who were educated there are now heads of affairs of that nation, and at present the five civilized tribes have their own schools, giving their own support. Therefore, I claim that the reservation system has and can prepare Indians to become useful and independent citizens (Applause).

Honorable Judges, statistics show that the reservation schools, before the non-reservation schools were established,

could have accomplished what is now being accomplished by both the reservation and non-reservation schools, if the chances had not been taken away. Charles Lord was taught and raised on the Fond du Lac Reservation, and when he was twenty five years of age, he left the reservation, and shortly after that he was elected and re-elected a Constable of Superior City in Wisconsin; he also served other offices of trust. (Applause) Was he not a useful and independent citizen? Many others I could present tonight, but time will not permit me to do so.

A very great Indian went on the war-path and made himself terrible, but in later years in leading his people, his experience on the reservation became useful. Is not this practical education on the reservation? We have such men on reservations as Quannah Parker, American Horse, etc., who are useful and independent, and have as much right to become citizens of the United States as the hundreds of foreigners who come in. These men are Indians, but Congress will not admit them as citizens until the whole tribe they represent become citizens of the United States. The Indians who have received education on the reservations are making good progress in agricultural pursuits, and some are competing with the white people in many features. These men were brought up on reservations, and are now fully prepared to become citizens of the United States, but the law is such that they cannot become citizens; the law will not admit them to be citizens.

In 1836 most of the Oneidas removed to Wisconsin, and these Indians held land in common and became farmers. In 1872 they became involved in claims according to the Act of Congress, and in 1889 sixty per cent of these Indians wanted to become full citizens at once, but at the various councils, they agreed to come under the Act of 1887, and hold the land in severalty for a period of twenty-five years before becoming full citizens. Now among the Oneidas, we have such men as Cornelius Hill, J. D. Cornelius, Cornelius Doxtator, James Wheelock, and others; and there are many other men in other reservations who have advanced themselves as these have. Two of these have made great progress, and the others are useful and independent, and are qualified to become citizens. These are only a few of the scores of Indians who are as much qualified to become citizens as those whom I have just mentioned. These men were brought up on reservations, and opponents, you can't say that the reservation system has failed to make useful and independent citizens of the Indians, when so many have already become citizens. (Applause.)

The Pueblos under the Mexican Government were citizens, and when they were annexed to the United States, Congress allowed these Indians to become citizens also. You must admit that these Indians are citizens, and were raised on reservations.

Statistics show that thirty-four per cent were independent, owning property; property owned by the Indians. This shows progress, and also proves that the reservation system has not failed at all, and has not killed ambition. If there is not ambition, there can be no progress, and you must admit, Honorable Judges and opponents, that the reservation when under the influence of Christian men have made progress in many ways. (Applause).

FRANCIS O. JONES, representing the Standard and affirmative side, said:

Mr. CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN: The first speaker on the negative side of this question says there is no limit as to time. I would like to ask him how long does he want for the reservation system to bring out its results, and make useful independent citizens of the Indians? I think the first reservations were instituted in 1830. Tonight we are considering citizen Indians, whether they are useful and independent in these United States. One of them makes no provision for the adult Indians, but deals only with the young. Allow me to tell you, only about thirty-five thousand are young Indians, and the rest, two hundred

and fifty thousand, are adults. It is admitted that the Government has been educating them for some years, and it is also admitted that the two systems adopted are the reservation system and the non-reservation system. To-night we are considering the reservation system and trying to make these Indians useful and independent citizens. The very first methods used in the reservation system proves that those who come under its influence progress not at all. These Indians are under the control of an Indian Agent, who has the power to allot land to the Indians, and he is in every way a despot. The Dawes Bill provided for the Indians becoming citizens, and some are made citizens by treaty. The question under debate to-night is whether or not the reservation system has made useful and independent citizens of Indians. Has the system succeeded in turning out citizens, law-abiding Indian citizens? We have shown that the methods used have failed to do this.

Allow us to state the condition of some. The Winnemagoes of Nebraska have been citizens since 1877. Today they have no practical knowledge of a citizen's rights, as is shown when they come to exercise the right of franchise. These Indians when they come to vote, simply follow the politicians in the way they want to vote, not being affected by one party or the other, but selling out their votes.

Indian citizens selling votes! (Applause).

They are not allowed to vote for themselves, or even choose their own career.

In placing before you a model of a useful, independent citizen, he must have sufficient education to cast a vote intelligently. We must conclude then that the Indians in this particular as citizens, are not useful and independent.

Another matter is the collection of taxes from these Indians. Many of these Indians do not know why they are taxed, as is shown in the case of some of the Indians in Oklahoma, where there are several

tribes under one agency. These Indians failed to pay their taxes, and as a matter of course their property was taken. If they want to have the rights of citizenship, they must of necessity support the Government, and these Indians don't know why they are taxed, or if they did know, they didn't mean to pay their taxes. The conditions which might be possible for Indians to become useful and independent are not offered in the reservation system. They acquire no title to any land they are cultivating, and don't realize the importance of owning the land.

The Comanches, as one part of the reservation system history shows, have almost returned to savagery. These Indians have not been taught to have a personal interest in some business, and when they have their allotments, they are unable to cultivate them and build up homes. The reservation system is a breeder of pauperism, and history has proven that it is.

The history of Ancient Rome will explain this feature. In the second generation before Christ, the rulers caused to be issued grain at half price, and allowed it finally to become free. What was the result? In a short time it resulted in many idlers and much idleness. The work of our Government in clothing the Indian with the office of citizenship, and vesting him with a tract of land in fee simple, does not make him useful and independent, unless he has been taught the use of independency and the principles of self-support. The feeding of many and the furnishing the Indian with agricultural supplies have driven out nearly every particle of self-reliance, and they are taught to live in idleness. This principle of feeding and clothing the Indian, in consideration of their good behavior, was good enough no doubt when first instituted, but it has outlived its usefulness, and what is the result? To-day the Indian stands vested with all the rights of citizenship of the United States, but he stands unfitted for citizen life. His proud spirit droops, and he is discouraged, and is a miserable creature, a victim of all the

vices and corruption, and it is in this deplorable condition that the world finds him today; the charity of the world has been exercised improvidently upon him, and religion has exhausted its best efforts upon him in vain. (Applause.)

ALEXANDER UPSHAW, representing the Negative and Invincible side:

CHAIRMAN, HONORABLE JUDGES, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN: The Indians on the reservation have to fall back on the Indian Agent for guidance and support. When the Indian on the reservation fails to produce crops, then he has to fall back upon the Agent, because he can't produce, anything on the soil he is farming; that is why. In 1870 General Grant became President of this country, and he adopted what was called the Peace Policy, to give the Christian people a chance to support the Indians, and, Honorable Judges, you must admit through the work of Bishops Whipple and Hare, and other men who have gone out to the Indians and established schools among them, educating them as citizens, the Indians have prepared themselves and have become useful and independent, even upon the reservations. You must admit that, sir. It is also a fact that the Indians on the reservation are held back, and I can prove it to you. Take the reservation system in Canada; they appoint an agent whose character is good, and who was selected by the Christian people, and the result to day is that the Indians in Canada are self-supporting and useful, and equal with the citizens of the United States. Is that not enough to prove to you that the Indians placed on the reservations have gone forward and become useful citizens and independent citizens on the reservation?

They have over four thousand Indians in Canada today that are self-supporting, and every year they go out and compete with the white farmer in every line; they are equal to their white neighbors; that is enough to show that the work of the reservation system has not failed. (Applause).

Do you expect Indians to be equal with the white people and to become citizens when they are not prepared? (Applause).

The Chippewa Indians were made citizens in 1850, and you can see them today, Capt. Pratt; go out among the Chippewas, and you will see they are self-supporting (Applause).

When you put the right men on the reservations, the results will be as great as with the Crow Indians today. Four years ago they placed an Army officer to work there and elevate them, and the result is, that every Crow Indian is working hard to prepare himself a home. When I was at the Crow agency, in 1894, I went there for the purpose of getting children for Carlisle. They said they had no time; they were making homes. They have established schools on the reservation that are working great results for themselves. I have seen those things for myself, sir. (Applause).

In Canada, scores of them have gone forward as stock-raisers and missionaries. Isn't that useful? The speaker spoke about the Indians selling their votes: How many white men in the country today sell their votes? (Applause).

The Indians have solved the problem of self-support and are independent, and are prepared to become citizens at this day. It is the fault of the Indian Agent, and the fault of the Government, and not the system itself, that they are not citizens. (Applause). Carlisle is part of the reservation system. We are producing hundreds of useful citizens from this school, and if you have produced citizens from this school you are making citizens through the reservation system (Applause).

Show me any nation existing on the globe today the citizens of which were equally useful and independent at the same time? You expect the Indians on the reservation to become citizens all at once; there are hundreds of them now ready to become useful and independent citizens, but you make a law through Mr. Dawes that whoever abandons his tribe, his claim, and everything he has, can become a citizen. It is no

fault of his if he does not. Foreigners are allowed to come into this country, as ignorant as those under the reservation; they are not even as well prepared, but you admit them to become citizens and you politicians have gone among them and bought votes from them. (Applause.)

You allow these puppers and ignorant men from foreign nations to vote, and if you allow the Indians to vote at this day, you will have better citizens, as there are today over in Canada, citizens who are self-supporting, and independent, because they are worked up by Christian men.

We have scores of them in the Indian Territory through the work of the Episcopal, Presbyterian and all other denominations, and you, Honorable Judges, must admit this, because these Christian men have worked so hard, and the result will be shown hereafter. (Applause)

FRANK CAJUNE, for the Invincible, then closed the negative side:

My opponent spoke of the Nebraska Indians. I will tell you how they became citizens. The Indians in the first place were not prepared to become citizens; they were made so by the recommendation of a representative from Nebraska. He could not think of anything else that he could do before Congress, so he took the Indians for example, to make a mark in Congress. I think Honorable Judges, that we have proven, first, that the reservation system itself has not failed, and that it is not to blame for any failure, but the persons in charge are to blame.

Secondly, that the reservation system has produced Indians who are useful and independent, and prepared them to become citizens.

Thirdly, that the reservation schools have produced many who have gone through them, and today are useful and independent citizens among the whites. (Applause.)

ROBERT DEPOE, for the Affirmative and Standard side, then closed the debate:

The speaker preceding the last, spoke about the great Crow Indians of Montana as self-supporting Indians; four years ago he went out among them. Now, Honorable Judges, four years ago look what the Government did; look how much money the Government gave to these Crows in Montana for support and clothing—\$97,500. (Applause.)

The speaker also brought up the Winnebago Indians, as not being prepared. Why were they not prepared? Because the reservation system failed to prepare them. (Applause.)

Honorable Judges, the speaker preceding the last brings in about the Canadian Indians. We are not considering Canada tonight, but the United States Indians. (Applause.)

Another speaker said the Indians fall back on the agent. Why? Because the reservation system has not educated them to think for themselves; that is why they fall back on the agent. (Applause.)

Another one said Carlisle is part of the reservation system. We deny that, and we have authority for it. Carlisle is a distinct system, and has nothing to do with the reservation system. (Applause.) It brings the Indians from these reservations, out of pauperism, and puts them in the east, and there they become educated and independent. That is not a part of the reservation system. (Applause.)

Another speaker said that the reservation system has made useful and independent citizens, who have gone out into the world. What world? Why the reservation world. (Applause.)

Furthermore, they have brought in the Oneidas as solving the problem. Why, today these Indians in Wisconsin are receiving annuities from the Government. Do you call these independent citizens who are receiving annuities from the Government? (Applause.)

Now, Honorable Judges, we have proven to you, clearly and distinctly, I think, that the reservation system has failed to make useful and independent citizens of the Indians, and the negative, in the end, will no doubt support us in

showing to the whole United States in future years that the reservation system is not good for the Indians. (Applause.)

And when the time comes we hope to prove, the affirmative and the negative, to the whole world that the Indians who are receiving education have solved the problem. (Applause.)

The Judges then retired to arrive at a decision, and the Indian Band rendered two selections.

The Judges entering the room, the Presiding Officer asked if they had reached a conclusion?

HON. R. H. HENDERSON: The Judges have arrived at a decision.

We have listened with a great deal of interest and admiration to the question debated on that platform this evening, and if it were to be decided personally, it would be hard to give a decision. We have not failed to consider that the question has two sides, and whilst the Judges may have opinions of their own upon the merits of this question, I am happy to say we have great admiration for the intelligent manner in which the negatives held up their side of the issue. It is a true prophecy that a man cannot lift himself from the ground by his boot straps. (Laughter.) I don't know whether these young gentlemen or any of the hundreds of students of Carlisle have ever tried to lift themselves over a fence in this way. Now, young gentlemen of the negative side, we feel that you have handled this question very intelligently, and that you have done so well, that you deserve much of the credit we feel like awarding to both sides. The genius of one of the speakers, who claims that the reservation system has not failed, was remarkable, and I think it was one of the most eloquent and pleasing speeches I have ever heard given on this platform from the negative side of any question. But he too was handicapped by the fault of the Government in that the system does not progress as he would like. I would feel very much like drawing the line right here but it is almost impossible to do the present question, to take sides. For the Judges, I am compelled to say, that having taken everything into consideration, they think the affirmative side has satisfied them beyond a reasonable doubt that the reservation system has failed. But I am happy to say that there are more elements of true citizenship in the young gentlemen that sit around that table, than have ever been brought forth under the reservation system. In the face of this, therefore, if the reservation system has not failed, then the magnificent work of Capt Pratt here, at Carlisle, has failed, and no one can admit that. I will now ask that my colleagues be called upon to support me by a few remarks. (Applause.)

REV. ALEXANDER McMILLAN: I concur in all that has been said, and for myself, I was certainly well-pleased with the excellent speeches and the closeness of the argument as the debate progressed, but the arguments of the affirmative side were so conclusive, that we could not help but decide in their favor. (Applause.)

REV. A. N. HAGERTY: We elected Judge Henderson Chairman of this committee, because we desired him to have the opportunity of saying a few words. This is the first debate I have had the pleasure of listening to at this school, and it will not be the last, if I have that opportunity again, whether I am invited or not, I am coming. (Applause and cries of Hear, Hear.)

I can not say that I have enjoyed the debate any more than my other two colleagues; the fact is, it is one of the most entertaining debates that I have listened to in a long time; not simply from the standpoint of a spectator, but from the merits of the case. First, the enthusiasm of these young gentlemen during the debate, and the manner in which the negative side handled their part of the subject, and from all the points that they had in mind, the spirit before them of trying to convince the Judges they were right, was remarkable, and we admired that spirit. In deciding the question, I made it my business to follow each speak-

er closely, and mark down the merits of each speech; first the matter contained in the argument, and all that went to make up the material of the speech; secondly, the manner and gestures and other elements of presenting their addresses; and thirdly, the language of the speakers. And I find that the affirmative side has just one-half point more than the negative. You can see that it was a close discussion. This question is such an interesting one, that I paid it a great deal of attention, and I cannot help saying that the reservation has failed to make the Indians useful citizens of this great country of ours. I wish to thank you for the pleasure of speaking to you this evening, and in being allowed to listen to this entertaining discussion. (Applause.)

HON. E. W. BIDDLE: I desire to say a few words to these young gentlemen, on behalf of this audience. I have listened with a great deal of interest to the speech, and it is not surprising that the Judges deliberated some time as to the relative merits of the two sides, without reaching any definite decision. The enthusiasm of the speakers in the question which has been the basis of the issue between these two societies, shows that these young gentlemen are students; that they are no longer idle sons of the prairie, but are ready to compete with educated men and to live protected by the arm of citizenship. I am satisfied that every one here within the sound of the voice of the speakers, is not only delighted but surprised with the spirit which each of these young gentlemen has manifested, and I hope, young gentlemen, that you will continue in following the line that you have chosen and at the same time that you may become great, and stand as examples for the future welfare of the Indians of this country. (Applause.)

CHAIRMAN: Capt. Pratt, the audience would like to hear from you.

CAPTAIN PRATT: MR. CHAIRMAN,

LADIES AND GENTLEMEN: I had a great interest in this question, and when the young gentlemen waited upon me, as a committee, and asked me to preside, I felt that it would be improper for me to do so, because of my interest. I suggested that the debate be entirely free from the influence of the management and instructors of the school. I have not been present at any of the society meetings, and had no knowledge of the programme, until it came before the audience to-night.

I am pleased with the approval of the speakers by the very distinguished gentlemen who have favored us with their presence. It is a great honor to have the attendance of such gentlemen, and their interest in our school, and that they can say such good words for us, as they have said is especially gratifying.

Upon the merits of the question, let me say, that the affirmative had much the stronger side. The one who represented the negative side so well, said to me within a few days, that he was going to talk against his convictions. It is hard for a man to do that, so that Judges and everyone are almost convinced. The last speaker, hit the nail on the head. He said that these independent, useful citizens mentioned were all reservation citizens. That told the whole story. We talk about citizenship; we may talk about civilized tribes, but what are we to do with these citizens when they are not able to stand side by side with the other people of this great country? Can it be possible, therefore, for reservations to produce independent, useful citizens? As one speaker said, such a man may be an independent reservation citizen, but looks to Washington all the time for support, and does not depend on his own muscle and grit. No such man is a useful, independent man and citizen of the United States any more than the man in the poor house over there, no matter how good a man he is. It makes no difference how useful he is on the reservation, a useful, independent citizen of the United States must move out and gain his own support in competition, and not only be no load on the Gov-

ernment, but must be able to help support the Government.

One of the negative speakers referred to Carlisle as a reservation. He was right; entirely right; we are all Indians here. But I was a little sorry that the other failed to tell what Carlisle is doing in the direction of self-support and independence. How that every year over five hundred of the Carlisle students go out from the school, and work all summer, earning for themselves and their own uses over \$20,000 a year, and that they failed to speak about the two hundred Carlisle students now out in the public schools of the east earning their own way in schools with white children. That is the beginning of true citizenship, and all Indian work must come to that or there is no solution. The country is looking every day for men who are useful, men who are ready to work and compete and build up the country, and when all the Indians get to that point, and begin to show a real desire for independence and self support, I shall feel that the end of my services for them is approaching. (Applause.)

The whole school and audience gave three rousing cheers for the presiding officer of the evening, Hon. E. W. Biddle, and the Indian Band rendered a selection, to the time of which the members of the school marched out to their respective quarters. The speeches were taken down in shorthand by Mr. John Rhey.

CAPT. PRATT'S SEVENTEENTH ANNUAL REPORT.

CARLISLE, PA.,
September 24th, 1896.

TO THE HONORABLE,
THE COMMISSIONER OF INDIAN AFFAIRS,
WASHINGTON, D. C.

SIR:—

In making this, my annual report, I respectfully call your attention to my sixteen previous reports, and have only to add that the population during the year came from 100 different tribes; that the whole number of pupils under care for some portion of the year was 898, and that the average attendance was 722.93. This made our per capita cost to the Government a trifle more than \$141.00, which includes the cost of transporting children to and from their homes, new buildings, repairs and improvements of all kinds. In any just comparisons with the expenses of other schools these facts should be taken into account. This economy resulted largely from the use of our outing system. 155 of our students attended public schools during the winter and had the continuous benefits of family life. During the vacation months of July and August we had 506 out at work at one time with farmers and others. The total earnings from this outing amounted to \$19,238.62, of which the girls earned \$6,480.60 and the boys \$12,758.02. Of these sums the boys saved \$5,561.19 and the girls \$3,037.29, a total of \$8,598.48. The expenditures were mostly for clothing. Their total savings from past years and for the year of this report, on hand at the end of June were \$15,294.96, the larger part of which the students have on interest at 6% in safely secured bonds.

Trusting that these facts may have some slight influence in favor of enlarged opportunities for Indians along these lines and to encourage the liberating of them from tribal and reservation idleness and the making use of them as factors in our civilized industrial life, I am,

Respectfully,
R. H. PRATT,
Capt. 10th Cav'y., U. S. A., Supt.

CLEAN SPORT

is the goal which a great many enthusiastic lovers of decent athletics have set for themselves. One of the aims of the Young Men's Christian Association is to remove the objectionable features which frequently surround healthy outdoor sports. With the regard for the ethics of sport comes Christian courtesy and gentlemanly behavior. — Men of Dayton.

If you are not already a subscriber, will it not pay you to become one?